

## **Definitief onderzoek naar 20 artikelen van correspondent Oscar Garschagen**

### **I Samenvatting**

NRC-correspondent in Shanghai Oscar Garschagen werd begin september door zijn lokale nieuwsassistent beschuldigd van het fabriceren van nieuws en het plagiëren van andere media. Uit intern onderzoek is gebleken dat in de betwiste artikelen inderdaad ernstige journalistieke fouten zijn gemaakt.

Aan alle artikelen ligt uitgebreide verslaggeving van Oscar ten grondslag, dat staat buiten kijf. Maar bij het schrijven ging het mis. Dat heeft geleid tot slordigheden, citaten die zijn toegeschreven aan de verkeerde persoon of verkeerd zijn opgeschreven, citaten van verschillende personen die zijn samengepakt in één persoon (soms met fictieve namen), details die door elkaar zijn gehaald en in enkele gevallen tot plagiaat.

### **II De aanleiding**

Op zondagavond 3 september publiceerde Zhang Chaoqun, de toenmalig nieuwsassistent van onze correspondent Oscar Garschagen een artikel in het Chinees op WeChat (inmiddels niet meer beschikbaar), waarin hij Oscar beschuldigt van het verzinnen van artikelen en van plagiaat. Zhang en Oscar hebben ongeveer twee jaar intensief samengewerkt, van augustus 2015 tot de publicatie van het stuk.

De redactie werd zich op maandagochtend bewust van deze beschuldigingen. Toen bleek Zhang op 3 september ook een e-mail te hebben gestuurd naar het algemene mailadres van NRC, met dezelfde beschuldigingen (bijlage 1). Op maandag 4 september verscheen ook een [Engelstalige versie van het blog van Zhang](#).

De hoofdredactie heeft Oscar direct verzocht in detail op de aantijgingen van Zhang te reageren. Oscar heeft dat gedaan in een uitgebreide mail van 4 september. Die mail vormde de basis voor het [blog](#) dat de hoofdredacteur van NRC op 5 september publiceerde. In dat blog kreeg Oscar de kans om een weerwoord te geven op de aantijgingen en is de hoofdredactie achter Oscar gaan staan.

Tegelijkertijd hebben we daar aangekondigd de zaak grondiger te willen onderzoeken. Dit is het resultaat van dat onderzoek.

In de dagen na publicatie heeft Zhang meerdere malen, grotendeels op ons verzoek, aanvullende informatie gestuurd. Zo voerde hij op 7 september bronnen aan die ontkenden met Oscar te hebben gesproken (bijlage 3). In latere mails betwistte hij de integriteit van weer nieuwe artikelen van Oscar.

Ook ontving NRC een e-mail van de chef buitenland en de ex-China-correspondent van het Amerikaanse radiostation NPR. Zij beschuldigen daarin Oscar van het plagiëren van twee verhalen van hun website. Ook de Volkskrant meldde zich met de vraag of Oscar te vrijelijk heeft geput uit een artikel van hun correspondent Marije Vlaskamp.

In dit definitieve rapport zijn alle 20 artikelen onderzocht waarover wij klachten hebben gekregen van Zhang en van anderen.

### **III De aanpak**

Op 5 september hebben we contact opgenomen met Zhang, met het verzoek om ons zoveel mogelijk documentatie te sturen dat zijn claims ondersteunt. Sindsdien hebben we vele malen contact met hem gehad, zowel via telefoon als e-mail.

Tegelijkertijd zijn we in gesprek gegaan met Oscar, om een voor een zijn verhalen door te nemen en een beeld te krijgen van de context waarin de fouten zijn gemaakt. Ook hebben we met hem zijn aantekeningen, foto's, visitekaartjes en andere relevante documentatie doorgenomen. Mede hiervoor is hij naar Nederland afgereisd.

We hebben contact gehouden met de oud-correspondent van NPR, om diens claims van plagiaat hard te krijgen. We hebben een aantal mensen gebeld om te controleren of Oscars versie van de gang van zaken inderdaad klopt. En we hebben op de redactie proberen te reconstrueren hoe de verhalen tot stand kwamen.

Tot slot hebben we een oud-assistent van hem gebeld als referentie, om een beeld te krijgen van Oscars werkwijze vóór hij met Zhang ging samenwerken.

### **IV Algemene bevindingen**

In de gesprekken met Oscar is goed duidelijk geworden hoe hij deze verhalen heeft gemaakt, en hoe de fouten hebben kunnen ontstaan.

Duidelijk is dat uitgebreide verslaggeving de basis is geweest van de verschillende stukken. Hij kan ettelijke foto's laten zien van de omgeving waarin de verhalen spelen, van de mensen die hij heeft geïnterviewd. Filmpjes, waarin hij zelf achtergrondinformatie inspreekt. Verder verzamelde assistent Zhang van tevoren achtergrondinformatie en verhalen uit andere media over hetzelfde onderwerp.

Wat we niet hebben gezien, zijn originele aantekeningen. Zoals Oscar uitlegt: zijn aantekeningen bestonden meestal uit losse krabbels in notitieblokken, die hij weggooide als ze vol waren. Wel hebben we verschillende interviewverslagen. Als Zhang een interview bijwoonde om te vertalen, typte hij na afloop het gespreksverslag uit en stuurde hij het naar Oscar. Daarnaast deed Oscar, die zich inmiddels in dagelijkse gesprekken goed in het Chinees kan redden, interviews in zijn eentje.

Met deze ingrediënten, schreef Oscar zijn verhalen. Hij noemt zichzelf een „ouderwetse journalist die kijkt, luistert, notities maakt en daarna probeert er een zo mooi mogelijk verhaal van te maken“.

Oscar vertelt hoe het werken hem de afgelopen twee jaar steeds zwaarder ging vallen. Hij leed onder de druk van het werken in een onvrij land als China, waar hij structureel werd gevuld, afgeluisterd of lastiggevallen door de staatsveiligheid. Ook zijn bronnen kregen

meerdere malen last met de autoriteiten. Soms werden ze gewaarschuwd dat ze niet met buitenlanders moesten praten en haakten ze om die reden af bij interviews. Hij raakte sowieso gefrustreerd van hoe moeilijk het was om bronnen te pakken te krijgen: twintig faxen sturen, en nog steeds belde de hoogleraar of expert niet terug.

Ook het werken in zijn eentje, viel hem zwaarder. De relatie met assistent Zhang Chaoqun was niet goed, ook doordat Zhang geen journalistieke achtergrond heeft. „Met andere assistenten was ik een team, met hem niet.” Oscar zag op tegen zijn pensioen, wilde laten zien dat hij ‘het nog steeds kon’. Terugkijkend concludeert Oscar dat hij al lange tijd kampte met ernstige vermoeidheid en depressie, waar hij niet aan wilde toegeven. Hij ziet dit niet als excus, maar wel als verklaring waardoor hij fouten ging maken.

In zijn eigen ogen lukte het verslaggeven minder goed. Dagenlang rondreizen, en nog steeds niet genoeg goede interviews. Nog steeds belde hoogleraar zus-of-zo niet terug. Hij ging dat in enkele gevallen, in zijn eigen woorden, „schrijvend oplossen”, puttend uit de gesprekken, indrukken en overige elementen.

Dat heeft geleid tot een vijftal type fouten:

- Slordigheden, zoals namen die door elkaar zijn gehaald.
- Citaten die zijn toegeschreven aan de verkeerde persoon, of die verkeerd zijn opgeschreven.
- Details en sfeerbeschrijvingen die niet kloppen of aan de verkeerde situatie zijn toegeschreven.
- Citaten van verschillende mensen die zijn samengenomen in één persoon, vaak met een fictieve naam.
- In enkele gevallen tot het overnemen van andere media zonder bronvermelding.

## V De verhalen

### 1. Oud in China: ik wil niet tot last zijn, dus ik spring

(5 november 2015)

#### De kwestie:

Dit verhaal gaat over de golf van zelfmoord onder ouderen in China. Volgens Zhang zijn de volgende fouten gemaakt (zie bijlage 1):

1. Zhang heeft voor Oscar materiaal verzameld uit lokale media (zie bijlage 2), over twee gevallen van zelfmoord onder ouderen. Een ervan gaat over Wang Bingzhang, het andere over Xia Jumao. Volgens Zhang heeft Oscar de twee verhalen met elkaar vermengd en gedaan alsof de verhalen uit de lokale pers van hemzelf waren.

#### Conclusie:

Oscar geeft toe dat hij hier fouten gemaakt heeft. Die zijn als volgt te beschrijven:

1. Oscar heeft de informatie uit Chinese media (vertaald door Zhang) gebruikt zonder bronvermelding. Bij het schrijven heeft hij namen door elkaar gehaald (Wang Bingzhang en Xia Jumao).
2. Hij heeft in een citaat van Chen Si, de man die patrouilleert bij een brug om mensen van zelfmoord te weerhouden, per abuis vermeld dat Xiao Jumao (sic) door Chen is gered. Uit lokale media blijkt juist dat de man zelfmoord heeft gepleegd. Dit is te verklaren door slordigheid. Volgens Oscar vertelde Chen in het interview uitgebreid over gevallen in de media, en over mensen die hij heeft gered. Deze zijn verwisseld.

## 2. [De vissers en veroveraars van de Zuid-Chinese Zee](#)

(8 juli 2016)

### **De kwestie:**

In dit verhaal zoekt Oscar in Tanmen, Hainan, de vissers op die een rol zouden spelen bij het bezetten van eilanden in de Zuid-Chinese Zee door China. Volgens Zhang zijn de volgende fouten gemaakt (zie bijlage 1):

1. In het verhaal citeert Oscar commandant Wang Shumao. Volgens Zhang heeft Wang dit interview echter geweigerd en heeft het niet plaatsgevonden.
2. In het verhaal citeert Oscar ook kapitein Feng Ruibo. Volgens Zhang heeft de kapitein in werkelijkheid een andere voornaam (Ruibo is de voornaam) en heeft hij heel andere dingen gezegd dan in het verhaal staan.
3. Volgens Zhang heeft Oscar details verzonden, zoals dat Feng kwam aanrijden in een BMW en het nummer van zijn vissersboot.

### **Conclusie:**

Oscar geeft toe dat hij in dit verhaal fouten heeft gemaakt. Die zijn als volgt te beschrijven:

1. Het gesprek met kapitein Feng Ruibo heeft niet op deze manier plaatsgevonden. Feng Ruibo is geen bestaand persoon, maar een samenvoeging van verschillende vissers en kapiteins die allemaal tot de familie Feng behoren. Van deze mensen heeft hij foto's laten zien, geen aantekeningen. Hij heeft hun verhalen samengevoegd in het verhaal van 'Feng Ruibo', ter wille van de 'leesbaarheid' en om hun identiteit te beschermen, want tijdens de gesprekken werden ze uiteengedreven door de politie en vervolgens voortdurend gevolgd.
2. Details zoals de witte BMW en het nummer van de boot zijn gebaseerd op dingen die hij daar heeft gezien, zoals te zien is in een video die Oscar heeft gemaakt, maar zijn in de context waarin hij ze heeft beschreven feitelijk onjuist.
3. Oscar heeft geprobeerd commandant Wang Shumao te spreken, maar die heeft geweigerd. Het gesprek met Wang Shumao heeft Oscar gehaald uit Engelstalige Chinese media.

## 3. [Achter de facade loopt China vast](#)

(7 januari 2016)

### **De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over ‘zombiefabrieken’: bedrijven die eigenlijk failliet zijn, maar kunstmatig in leven worden gehouden. Oscar en Zhang bezochten hiervoor de regio rond de stad Lüliang. Over dit verhaal ontving NRC de volgende klachten:

1. Volgens Zhang heeft Oscar nooit de fabriek Chuandong Cement bezocht, waar een aantal alinea's van het verhaal zich afspeLEN.
2. Volgens Zhang heeft Oscar ook niet de witgoedzaak bezocht die in het verhaal voorkomt.
3. National Public Radio (NPR) vermoedt dat Oscar in dit stuk twee verhalen van voormalig NPR-correspondent Frank Langfitt heeft geplagieerd. Het gaat om de verhalen [A 'sense of crisis' now in a Chinese boomtown gone bust](#) (16 september 2015) en [China's white elephants: ghost cities, lonely airports, desolate factories](#) (15 oktober 2015).
4. NPR heeft contact opgenomen met meneer Gao en mevrouw Lei, die allebei voorkomen in het verhaal van Oscar én in het verhaal van de NPR. NPR heeft aan NRC de chatgesprekken opgestuurd waarin de twee mensen bevestigen dat zij buiten de NPR-correspondent nooit meer met een buitenlandse journalist hebben gesproken.

**Conclusie:**

Oscar heeft voor dit verhaal verschillende fabrieken en andere plaatsen in de regio rond Lüliang bezocht en veel mensen gesproken. Hij heeft hier foto's en videobeeld van. Maar bij het schrijven heeft hij fouten gemaakt, bevestigt Oscar. Die zijn als volgt te beschrijven:

1. Oscar bevestigt dat hij voor passages uit dit verhaal heeft geput uit de verhalen van National Public Radio (NPR). Zoals het gesprek met Gao Liwei, in de fabriek Chuandong Cement. Oscar heeft hem inderdaad nooit gesproken, zoals Gao ook tegen NPR heeft gezegd.  
De citaten van Gao in het verhaal zijn gebaseerd op de stukken van NPR en op interviews met anderen, die Oscar heeft gehouden voor dit stuk. Dat geldt ook voor sommige details uit het verhaal. Zo toont Oscar een foto waarop hij met een andere man bovenop het dak van een fabriek staat. In het verhaal beschrijft hij hoe hij dit doet met Gao.
  2. Ook het gesprek met verkoopster Lei van de witgoedwinkel heeft niet plaatsgevonden. Ook hiervoor heeft hij geput uit NPR en uit gesprekken die hij zelf voerde. Zoals met de mevrouw in een keramiekzaak, die hij op de foto heeft staan.
  3. Het is aannemelijk dat Oscar enkele andere details uit het verhaal die óók bij NPR voorkomen (de honden, de verlaten slaapzalen) wel degelijk zelf heeft gezien. Hij is tenslotte deels op dezelfde plaatsen geweest. De foto's en het videobeeld dat hij heeft, corresponderen met de beschreven sfeerbeelden (zoals het verlaten vliegveld).
- 4. [Alle wegen leiden naar Peking](#)**  
(12 mei 2017)

**De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over de ‘nieuwe zijderoute’, de grote infrastructurele vernieuwingen die China moeten verbinden met Europa. Oscar bezocht hiervoor, samen met Zhang, het gebied rond Horgos op de grens tussen China en Kazachstan. Hij reisde hiervoor ook – zonder Zhang – de grens met Kazachstan over. NRC ontving over dit verhaal de volgende klachten:

1. Volgens Zhang heeft de lokale partijfunctionaris Guo Jianbin andere dingen gezegd dan Oscar in zijn verhaal heeft opgeschreven. Als bewijs daarvoor heeft hij het gespreksverslag opgestuurd van het interview met Guo Jianbin (bijlage 4). Later heeft Zhang contact opgenomen met de pr-afdeling van Horgos, die zeggen dat enkele zinnen uit het stuk van Oscar niet kloppen (bijlage 5).
2. Volgens Zhang heeft Oscar ten onrechte opgeschreven dat er sluipschutters op het dak van een hotel zaten.

#### **Conclusie:**

We hebben geen reden om aan te nemen dat beschuldigingen van Zhang over dit verhaal kloppen. Oscar heeft geloofwaardig aangetoond dat met dit verhaal niets mis is.

1. Hij heeft foto's getoond van hemzelf met partijfunctionaris Guo Jianbin. Volgens Oscar komen de citaten van de partijbaas uit het informele gesprek dat ze hadden tijdens een autorit en tijdens het rondlopen. Ze komen dus niet uit het formele interview, waarvan Zhang een gespreksverslag heeft opgestuurd. Tijdens de autorit zei hij dingen als ‘Begin volgend jaar kan je van hier doorrijden naar Rotterdam’. We vinden dit aannemelijk, ook gezien het feit dat er maar een paar citaten van Guo in het stuk voorkomen. Dat de pr-afdeling van Horgos, die niet bij het gesprek was, maanden later enkele frases uit het stuk betwist, zegt wat ons betreft niet zoveel.
  2. Wat betreft de sluipschutters: Oscar geeft aan deze gezien te hebben vanuit de Kazachse zijde van de grens, waar Zhang niet bij was. Oscar heeft visumstempels in zijn paspoort laten zien, waaruit blijkt dat hij de genoemde dagen inderdaad in Kazachstan was. Wat hij daar gezien heeft, valt niet te controleren.
5. [Geen bewijs, toch twaalf jaar Chinese cel voor Nederlander](#)  
(8 december 2016)

#### **De kwestie:**

In het verhaal over de Nederlandse verdachte Harm Fitié interviewde Oscar Garschagen onder meer zijn advocaat Wang Fu. Hij citeert hem als volgt: ‘Het is overduidelijk geen eerlijk proces’. Volgens Zhang heeft advocaat Wang dit niet gezegd. Als bewijs heeft hij het interviewverslag opgestuurd, waarin Wang dit inderdaad niet zegt (bijlage 6).

#### **Conclusie:**

Oscar bevestigt dat – bij nader inzien – het citaat niet afkomstig is van advocaat Wang Fu. Oscar verklaart de verwisseling als volgt. Voor hetzelfde verhaal interviewde hij ook de vriendin van verdachte Harm Fitié, Diane Vandesmet. Zij vertelde dat de advocaat tegen háár had gezegd dat hij zich zorgen maakte over de rechtsgang. Dit is als een rechtstreeks citaat van advocaat Wang Fu in het verhaal terechtgekomen. Vandesmet bevestigt desgevraagd aan NRC dat zij dit in het interview tegen Oscar heeft gezegd.

De reden dat Oscar dit niet eerder middels een correctie & aanvulling heeft rechtgezet, is dat hij het pas heeft ontdekt toen Zhang met zijn beschuldigingen kwam. Advocaat Wang heeft ook niet eerder bezwaar aangetekend.

## 6. [Xiaoping was bijna gewurgd voordat ze kon scheiden](#) **(12 juli 2017)**

### **De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over een nieuwe wet tegen huiselijk geweld in China, waarin Oscar uitgebreid het slachtoffer Lin Xiaoping aan het woord laat. Over dit verhaal ontving NRC de volgende klachten:

1. In de laatste alinea beschrijft Oscar dat mevrouw Lin appt dat er een schikking is getroffen volgens welke ze 9.000 dollar moet betalen aan haar ex-man. Volgens Zhang is dit niet waar, aangezien de zaak nog steeds niet beslecht is.
2. In latere e-mails betwist Zhang de citaten van Lin in het verhaal van Oscar. Als bewijs stuurt hij het gespreksverslag (bijlagen 7 en 8).
3. Volgens Zhang wist Oscar dat Lin Xiaoping een gefingeerde naam was, terwijl dat niet staat vermeld.

### **De conclusie:**

1. Oscar vertelt dat Zhang het oorspronkelijke interview met mevrouw Lin Xiaoping heeft gedaan, op basis van een vragenlijst die Oscar had opgesteld, en ook daarna contact met de vrouw heeft onderhouden. Oscar legt uit dat hij voor de citaten van Lin heeft geput uit het schriftelijke gespreksverslag van Zhang, maar ook op zaken die Zhang mondeling aan hem heeft overgebracht. De verschillen in visie over wat zij wel en niet heeft gezegd, kan Oscar niet verklaren. „Kennelijk zijn er in de communicatie misverstanden ontstaan.”
2. Oscar zegt dat zijn conclusie dat er een schikking was getroffen, was gebaseerd op een chatgesprek van Zhang met Lin, dat Zhang mondeling aan hem heeft overgebracht. Zhang heeft hem later gemeld dat er geen schikking was. Oscar heeft er niet aan gedacht dit te rectificeren, toen hij erachter kwam.
3. Inderdaad bevestigt Oscar dat Lin Xiaoping een gefingeerde naam is. Die heeft hij gebruikt om haar te beschermen, gezien de gevoeligheid van dit onderwerp. Volgens Oscar is dit onder journalisten in China een gebruikelijke manier van doen, aangezien bronnen die met buitenlandse journalisten praten gevaar kunnen lopen. Dit is niet besproken met de redactie.

## 7. [Chinese ‘goudmijnen’ sluiten massaal](#) **(26 januari 2017)**

### **De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over de golfsport in China die, vanwege de strijd tegen corruptie, in het verdomhoekje zit. Dit zijn de klachten die we over het verhaal ontvingen:

1. Oscar citeert een caddie van de Sheshan Golf Club, die zegt dat ze van een collega heeft gehoord dat Xi Jinping ooit bij de elitaire golfclub heeft gespeeld. Volgens Zhang heeft dit interview nooit plaatsgevonden, aangezien ze de golfclub niet in kwamen (bijlage 1).

- Ook zegt Zhang dat Oscar de golfexpert Han Liebao nooit heeft gesproken, en hem ten onrechte Han Lie heeft genoemd in het verhaal (bijlagen 1 en 3).

**Conclusie:**

- Oscar bevestigt dat het gesprek met golfhoogleraar Han Liebao niet heeft plaatsgevonden. Oscar heeft voor dit citaat geput uit wat Han heeft gezegd op drie of vier verschillende plekken, waaronder zijn eigen blog, een golfblad en op de radio. Hij heeft geprobeerd Han te bereiken, om vervolgens de bijeengeraapte citaten te vervangen door echte citaten. Toen dat niet lukte, heeft hij het verhaal met de bijeengesprokkelde ‘citaten’, zonder bronvermelding, naar de redactie gestuurd. Overigens heet de man inderdaad Han Liebao, en niet Han Lie.
- Volgens Oscar heeft het gesprek met de caddie wel plaatsgevonden, maar was Zhang daar niet bij. Kort nadat hij bij de golfclub voor een dichte deur stond, heeft hij in hetzelfde gebied een boswandeling gemaakt, waarbij hij aan het kletsen raakte met een groepje caddies. Het citaat van de caddie komt daarvandaan. Of dit gesprek inderdaad heeft plaatsgevonden, valt niet te controleren. Naar dit gebied reis je met de metro, dus er is ook geen ‘paper trail’ van de boswandeling. Wat ons betreft is de gang van zaken zoals Oscar die beschrijft, aannemelijk. Ook gezien het feit dat het maar één citaat is, waarvan Oscar nota bene verderop in het stuk opmerkt dat de opmerking van de caddie „niet erg geloofwaardig is”.
- [China beoordeelt straks alle burgers op basis van big data](#)  
(13 maart 2017)

**De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over het nieuwe ‘sociaal-krediet systeem’, waarbij China op basis van grote hoeveelheden data wil gaan meten hoe goed of slecht burgers zich gedragen. Over dit verhaal ontving NRC de volgende klachten:

- Zhang heeft contact opgenomen met professor Zhou Tao, die in het verhaal voorkomt. Volgens Zhang zegt Zhou dat Oscar hem op verschillende plekken verkeerd heeft geciteerd (bijlage 3).
- Zhang heeft ook contact opgenomen met professor Meng Tianguang. Deze zegt dat hij Oscar nooit heeft gesproken (bijlage 3).
- De Volkskrant heeft een mail gestuurd naar NRC waarin ze suggereert dat Oscar voor dit verhaal heeft geput uit het verhaal [Hoe China met big data modelstudenten creëert](#), van hun correspondent Marije Vlaskamp.

**Conclusie:**

- Oscar geeft toe dat hij professor Meng Tianguang niet heeft gesproken. De citaten in het stuk zijn bij nader inzien van de Leidse hoogleraar Rogier Creemers. Hoe hij op deze manier heeft kunnen ‘knoeien’, kan hij niet verklaren. Creemers bevestigt desgevraagd dat hij Oscar twee keer heeft gesproken en dat de citaten inderdaad goed van hemzelf kunnen zijn.
- Duidelijk is dat Oscar professor Zhou heeft geïnterviewd. Dat de professor zegt dat zijn citaten verkeerd zijn weergegeven, kan hij niet verklaren.
- Wat betreft de Volkskrant kunnen we hoogstens zeggen dat Oscar het verhaal van Marije Vlaskamp heeft gelezen, en vervolgens aan professor Zhou ook naar zaken

heeft gevraagd die hij in het VK-verhaal gezegd heeft. De weinige gelijkenis die er is tussen de stukken, is zo te verklaren.

## **9. Kritiek op de duurste Chinese film ooit is niet welkom**

(1 februari 2017)

### **De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over de film The Great Wall. Volgens Zhang zijn de volgende fouten gemaakt (bijlage 9):

1. Zhang heeft twijfels of Oscar daadwerkelijk met Zhang Ying gesproken heeft.
2. Ook twijfelt hij of Oscar zelf op het film-eiland geweest is waarvan in de reportage sprake is.

### **Conclusie:**

Oscar ontket foute gemaakt te hebben bij dit verhaal.

1. Het gesprek met Zhang Ying heeft plaatsgevonden, zegt Oscar. Hij sprak hem aan in de bioscoop en heeft na afloop van de film nog wat met hem gedronken en gesproken.
2. Oscar zegt dat hij een aantal malen (drie keer) in Qingdao Oriental Movie Metropolis is geweest, en dat Zhang daar niet bij was.

## **10. Dit programma trekt komende zondag 700 miljoen kijkers**

(5 februari 2016)

### **De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over een grote Chinese tv-show waar honderden miljoenen mensen naar kijken. Volgens Zhang zijn de volgende fouten gemaakt (bijlage 10).

1. De naam van Dokter Du is verkeerd gespeld
2. Dokter Du heeft de uitspraken zoals ze in het artikel staan niet gedaan in het telefonisch interview dat door Zhang gedaan is.

### **Conclusie:**

Oscar erkent een foute gemaakt te hebben in dit stuk.

1. Oscar geeft toe dat de naam van Erhu Du verkeerd geschreven is (hij schreef per abuis Enhu Du).
2. Over de citaten die niet in het transcript staan zegt Oscar: Ik heb Zhang gevraagd om citaten die ik uit andere media gehaald had bij Du te checken. Ook heeft Zhang aanvullende vragen gesteld aan Du. Ik heb het transcript gebruikt en ook de citaten die ik elders van hem heb gevonden.

## **11. Van de Chinese Muur wil iedereen een stukje**

(29 april 2016)

### **De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over de Chinese Muur die ernstig in verval is en geplunderd wordt. Het verhaal van Oscar over de Chinese muur wijkt op een aantal kleine punten af van info die

Zhang heeft verzameld. Denk aan leeftijden van geïnterviewden en andere details (zie bijlage 11).

**Conclusie:**

Oscar zegt dat hij de leeftijden van personen altijd aan het begin van een gesprek vraagt. Vaak vroegen geïnterviewden hem eerst naar zijn leeftijd, dan had hij een informeel gesprekje waarin ze persoonlijke details uitwisselden. Dat hij af en toe een leeftijd verkeerd verstaan heeft sluit Oscar niet uit. Verschillen in de details die Zhang over sommige personen heeft gevonden en die Oscar heeft opgeschreven kan hij niet verklaren.

**12. Mi Lao Shu oftewel Mickey Mouse verovert Shanghai**

(16 juni 2016)

**De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over het Shanghai Disney resort. Volgens Zhang heeft Xi Jinping geen videoboodschap gestuurd maar een brief. En volgens Zhang heeft Oscar niet met Disney-man Murray King gesproken (bijlage 12)

**Conclusie:**

Oscar houdt staande dat hij King gesproken heeft tijdens en na een persconferentie over de opening van het park. Volgens hem waren er op de persconferentie honderden journalisten aanwezig. Na afloop van de persconferentie heeft Oscar met een groepje journalisten nog met King gesproken. Oscar heeft zich nog aan King voorgesteld. Dat King zich dat nu niet meer herinnert neemt Oscar voor kennisgeving aan.

**13. Chinese terreurbestrijding verplichte gps in voertuigen**

(21 februari 2017)

**De kwestie:**

In dit verhaal over politiestaat China zijn volgens Zhang een aantal details verkeerd. (Zie bijlage 13)

**Conclusie:**

Oscar houdt staande wat hij heeft geschreven. De verschillen met Zhang zijn interpretatieverschillen, geen feitelijke verschillen.

**14. China heeft slimmeriken nodig voor militaire ambities**

(22 november 2016)

**De kwestie**

Dit verhaal gaat over de recruterings van slimme jongemannen voor het Chinese leger.

1. Zhang plaatst vraagtekens bij de authenticiteit van een van de bronnen, Mao Yiwu.
2. Ook trekt Zhang in twijfel of het genoemde aantal zelfmoorden en levenslange gevangenisstraffen wel klopt. (Zie bijlage 14)

**Conclusie:**

1. Wat het gesprek met Mao Yiwu betreft zegt Oscar het volgende: Ik heb Mao Yiwu op straat gezien en hem daar gesproken. Mijn assistent (niet Zhang, EK) heeft daarna met hem gechat op WeChat. Ik heb die assistent verzocht dat chatgesprek op te sturen maar nog geen reactie gekregen.
2. Oscar heeft als bron voor de genoemde cijfers over zelfmoorden en levenslang gestraften geput uit andere media, onder meer PLA Daily, de Financial Times, staatspersbureau Xinhua, Guangming Daily en de South-China Morning Post.

## **15. Oma Ten is arm want Wutao (12) heeft kanker**

(11 augustus 2016)

### **De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over kinderen met kanker en over de zorg die ouderen voor hen hebben. (zie bijlage 15)

1. Zhang trekt in twijfel of Oscar Zhang Ligiao zelf gesproken heeft.
2. Citaten in het artikel van een gesprek met dokter Wang zijn niet terug te vinden in het transcript dat Zhang maakte van een gesprek met Wang.
3. Ook vraagt hij zich af of Oscar de twee tieners die voorkomen in het stuk, zelf heeft gezien?

### **De conclusie:**

1. Oscar heeft door het laten zien van foto's aannemelijk gemaakt dat hij Zhang Ligiao zelf heeft gesproken.
2. Over het gesprek met dokter Wang zegt Oscar dat er een formeel deel was dat op band staat en dat is uitgewerkt door Zhang. Na afloop van dat formele gesprek heeft Oscar doorgepraat met Wang en is hij met hem gaan lunchen. Uit dat deel van het gesprek zijn de citaten afkomstig die in het artikel staan.
3. Oscar zegt dat hij de tieners wel degelijk heeft ontmoet.

Oscar laat aanvullend weten niets van de aantijgingen van Zhang te begrijpen. Hij houdt staande dat het verhaal van A tot Z klopt.

## **16. Het gevecht om de mummie in lotushouding**

(13 juli 2017)

### **De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over een verdwenen boeddhabebeld met een mummie erin (zie bijlage 16). Zhang zegt dat de naam van het hoofd van het dorpscomité verkeerd is en twijfelt of Oscar in de grot geweest is waar het beeld verborgen was.

### **De conclusie:**

Oscar vreest dat hij inderdaad de naam van het hoofd van het dorpscomité verkeerd heeft genoteerd (er waren veel mensen die Lin heten), en maakt verder overtuigend aannemelijk met foto's dat hij inderdaad in de grot en in vele andere grotten in de buurt geweest is. Het verhaal is voor publicatie nog gefiatteerd door een betrokken Nederlandse advocaat, Jan Holthuisen, die het dorp vertegenwoordigt.

## **17. Steeds meer Chinezen willen liever Jezus dan Mao**

(13 april 2017)

**De kwestie:**

Dit verhaal gaat over de toenemende populariteit van het christendom in China (zie bijlage 17).

1. Zhang constateert discrepanties tussen het transcript dat hij maakte van het interview met dominee Wang Yi en de uiteindelijke tekst in NRC.
2. Zhang zegt dat de citaten van een christelijk echtpaar dat in de kerk zit niet corresponderen met het gesprek dat hij met ze heeft gevoerd/waar hij bij was. Ook zijn de leeftijden van het echtpaar nooit ter sprake gekomen.

**De Conclusie**

1. Oscar zegt dat de citaten van Wang Yi, die hij al sinds 2008 kent, op meerdere gesprekken zijn gebaseerd. Hij zegt Wang Yi ontmoet te hebben en gesprekjes met hem te hebben gevoerd op de gang en met hem te zijn meegelopen. Tijdens die gesprekken heeft Oscar Wang Yi citaten uit andere media voorgehouden, gevraagd of dat nog steeds klopte. Later heeft er een formeel interview plaatsgevonden (waar Zhang het transcript van heeft uitgewerkt. Uit beide delen (formeel en informeel) heeft Oscar citaten gebruikt).
2. Oscar zegt dat Zhang net bij het gesprek met het christelijke echtpaar aanwezig was. Oscar zat achterin de kerk naast het echtpaar, Zhang zat ervoor. De citaten en de leeftijden heeft Oscar in dat gesprek opgehaald.

Hier staat Zhangs verklaring tegenover die van Oscar en is niet objectief vast te stellen of Zhangs klacht gegerond is.

**18. Mao heeft ons misleid**

(21 mei 2016)

**De kwestie:**

Zhang claimt dat veel citaten in dit stuk over voormalige Rode Gardisten in het leger van Mao Zedong gefabriceerd zijn. Hij heeft de transcripten van twee gesprekken doorgelezen en verschillen geconstateerd met de uiteindelijke versie in NRC.

**Conclusie:**

Het is niet formeel vast te stellen of de discrepanties die Zhang constateert ook daadwerkelijk betekenen dat die passages niet hebben plaatsgevonden. Oscar zegt dat het klopt dat er citaten in het stuk staan die niet op de transcripten zijn terug te vinden. Dat heeft volgens hem meerdere redenen. Het gesprek met de voormalige Rode Gardisten vond plaats in een restaurant waar vijf ex-Gardisten waren. Het gesprek duurde vijf uur, waarvan een deel aan een grote ronde tafel, en een deel in kleinere groepen. Niet alles gesprekken staan dus op band. Naast Oscar was ook een Australische journalist met zijn assistent bij het gesprek aanwezig.

Oscar legt verder uit dat Chinees een indirecte taal is, waarbij het lang duurt voordat je tot antwoorden komt. Als je dat letterlijk vertaalt en gebruikt in een stuk, is het onleesbaar, aldus Oscar. Je vertaalt én decodeert wat er gezegd is. Citaten in het stuk zijn daarmee soms ook weerslagen van de bedoeling van wat iemand zegt, en minder letterlijke teksten.

## **19. Chinese investeerders vrezen barstende zeepbellen**

(27 december 2016)

### **De kwestie**

In dit verhaal over de Chinese vastgoedmarkt ziet Zhang twee problemen (zie bijlage 19).

1. Hij kan geen bron vinden voor de beschrijving van 15.000 bouwvakkers die in het verhaal voorkomen.
2. Zhang zegt dat Oscar en hij het echtpaar Chaoqun en Stephanie Leng niet hebben gesproken.

### **Conclusie:**

1. Oscar kan niet meer achterhalen wat de bron is geweest voor de 15.000 bouwvakkers.
2. Oscar zegt het echtpaar Leng gesproken te hebben op het vliegveld in een hotel. Zhang was daar volgens Oscar niet bij.

Hier staat Zhangs verklaring tegenover die van Oscar en is niet objectief vast te stellen of Zhangs klacht gegerond is.

## **20. De energierevolutie in China**

(8 september 2017)

### **De kwestie**

In dit verhaal over de Chinese energierevolutie ziet Zhang een aantal problemen (zie bijlage 20)

1. Zhang trekt in twijfel of de geciteerde ex-mijnwerker echt Wang heet.
2. In het stuk is sprake van zonnepanelenparken in de vorm van Panda's, in werkelijkheid gaat het er volgens Zhang maar om één.
3. Er is volgens Zhang een fout gemaakt in het percentage Chinezen dat gelooft dat klimaatverandering door mensen is veroorzaakt.
4. In de kolencentrale zou volgens Zhang helemaal geen vierde toren in aanbouw zijn.
5. De citaten van mevrouw Yan Jing die in het stuk staan, staan niet op de band van het gesprek dat Oscar met haar had.

### **Conclusie:**

1. Oscar is niet zeker van de naam van Wang, hij had het op bijna alle plekken uit het artikel geredigeerd, maar het per ongeluk op een plaats laten staan.
2. Oscar zegt een kleine variant te hebben gezien van een zonnepanelenpark en zegt dat er nog een dergelijk park in ontwikkeling is.
3. Nadere bestudering van de cijfers leert inderdaad dat niet 93 procent van de Chinezen gelooft dat klimaatverandering door mensen wordt veroorzaakt, wel dat 93 procent van de Chinezen gelooft dat er klimaatverandering gaande is. Die omslag was de kern van het verhaal dat Oscar wilde vertellen in dit artikel. Het percentage Chinezen dat gelooft dat klimaatverandering door de mens wordt veroorzaakt, is 55 procent, zo meldde het blad *Foreign Policy* in mei 2017.
4. Volgens Oscar heeft de chauffeur van de auto waarin zij langs kolencentrale reden gezegd dat er een vierde toren in aanbouw zou zijn.

5. Oscar heeft mevrouw Yan Jong gesproken en naar eigen zeggen hier en daar ‘leidende vragen’ gesteld. Of de citaten nu precies zo gezegd zijn, is volgens Oscar niet relevant. Volgens hem vertegenwoordigen de citaten van Yan Jing precies wat Greenpeace in China altijd zegt.

## VI Werkwijze met nieuwsassistenten

Oscar Garschagen heeft in zijn tien jaar als NRC-correspondent in China, tussen de acht en negen nieuwsassistenten gehad. Bijna iedere buitenlandse correspondent in China werkt met een nieuwsassistent, die helpt met het overbruggen van taal- en culturele barrières. Zij helpen met het maken van afspraken voor interviews, verzamelen informatie in de lokale pers of in andere geschreven bronnen, komen met verhaalideeën, vertalen bij interviews en houden in sommige gevallen zelfstandig interviews, die door de correspondent worden gebruikt. In Nederlandse media wordt de naam van de assistent in de meeste gevallen niet bij artikelen vermeld.

Nieuwsassistenten worden geacht regelmatig de Chinese staatsveiligheidsdienst bij te praten over de activiteiten van ‘hun’ correspondent. Hoe open zij daarover zijn tegenover hun werkgever, is soms een punt van frictie, zoals een voormalige nieuwsassistent beschrijft in [dit artikel](#).

Zhang heeft telefonisch verteld dat hij het verdacht vond dat Oscar hem geen kladversie van zijn artikelen liet lezen (wat overigens de meeste correspondenten niet doen) en hem niet altijd een link gaf van de artikelen die hij schreef. Dat klopt volgens Oscar, omdat hij ervanuit ging dat Zhang de Nederlandse stukken toch niet kon lezen. Op zeker moment is Zhang de artikelen van Oscar gaan opsporen op internet en naar het Engels gaan vertalen met Google Translate. Daar is hij mee begonnen in november 2016. Zo ontdekte hij dat er onregelmatigheden in zaten.

NRC heeft nooit eerder dit soort klachten gehad over het werk van Oscar Garschagen.

Oscar stuurde zijn verhalen meestal via e-mail aan toenmalig bureauredacteur Azië Floris van Straaten en chef Buitenland Elske Schouten. Zij deden meestal de eerste lezing van verhalen, waarna soms vragen volgden of een tweede versie. Bij enkele van de onderzochte verhalen kwamen ze terecht bij de chefs van andere deelredacties, zoals Economie of de Zaterdagkrant.

Tijdens de reizen die Oscar voor verhalen maakten, hield hij geregelde contact met zijn bureauredacteur. Floris van Straaten bevestigt dat Oscar hem bij verschillende verhalen bijpraatte over de vorderingen, terwijl hij op pad was. Dit klopt ook, aangezien aan alle verhalen uitgebreide verslaggeving ten grondslag ligt. Herhaaldelijk, zegt Floris, was zijn hang naar perfectionisme zo groot dat hij nogmaals naar dezelfde plek afreisde, als hij nog niet tevreden was over zijn verhaal.

Alles bij elkaar waren er bij de redactie geen aanwijzingen dat in de verhalen fouten zaten. Ook was er geen sprake van dat verhalen onder te grote tijdsdruk moesten worden gemaakt.

NRC heeft telefonisch contact gehad met Sun Yu, een voormalig assistent van Oscar. Hij werkte voor hem van januari 2009 tot juli 2009. Hij stopte omdat hij ging studeren in de VS. Nadat hij terugkeerde in Shanghai en voor de Financial Times ging werken, hielden hij en Oscar ongeveer eens per maand vriendschappelijk contact.

Sun Yu beschrijft Oscar als een zeer serieus journalist, die altijd vertelde met welke nieuwe onderwerpen hij nu weer bezig was. Hij heeft nooit klachten gehad over de accuraatheid van Oscars werk, alleen over het feit dat Oscar soms met gevoelige onderwerpen bezig was. Hij is zelf ooit geciteerd in een verhaal van Oscar, en dat zag er wat hem betreft goed uit.

## VII Eindconclusie

De hoofdredactie moet concluderen dat ze, in elk geval voor een aantal van de hierboven genoemde artikelen, niet kan instaan voor het feit dat ze gebaseerd zijn op de eigen waarneming van onze correspondent. Duidelijk is dat Oscar zeker drie keer geput heeft uit stukken van andere media zonder daarbij de bronnen te vermelden. Ook in andere gevallen is duidelijk dat er journalistieke fouten gemaakt zijn.

Oscar zelf is zich terdege bewust van de fouten die hij gemaakt heeft. „Ik heb daarmee het vertrouwen van NRC en van de lezer beschaamd. Ik vergeef het mijzelf nooit dat ik zo stom ben geweest en dat ik de normen van NRC en van mijzelf heb geschonden.”

De hoofdredactie heeft, in samenspraak met Oscar, besloten dat op basis van voornoemde feiten er een vervroegd einde komt aan zijn dienstverband bij NRC. Oscar stopt per direct als correspondent in China en zal ook niet terugkeren op de redactie van NRC.

De hoofdredactie heeft verder besloten dat onder de stukken waar nu twijfel over is gerezen een noot zal worden geplaatst in ons archief. Die noot luidt: ‘Uit intern onderzoek is gebleken dat NRC niet kan instaan voor de journalistieke integriteit van dit verhaal.’ Dat geldt in elk geval voor de hierboven genoemde artikelen, voor zover daarin journalistieke fouten gemaakt zijn.

De hoofdredactie heeft verder contact opgenomen met Oscars voormalige assistent Zhang en hem bedankt voor het feit dat hij de zaken heeft aangebracht bij de redactie. Ook heeft de hoofdredactie excuses aangeboden aan Zhang voor het eerste blog over de zaak, waarin NRC achter Oscar ging staan en zich kritisch heeft uitgelaten over Zhangs beschuldigingen.

## VIII Lessen

De gevolgen van deze zaak hebben wij op de redactie besproken. Op basis van dat gesprek denken we na over hoe we de kwaliteit van onze stukken nog beter kunnen waarborgen. Onderdeel daarvan is het opnieuw onder de aandacht brengen van ons journalistieke Stijlboek bij alle redacteuren. We zullen redacteuren erop wijzen hoe belangrijk het is om hun artikelen goed te documenteren, zodat het achteraf makkelijker wordt verhalen te reconstrueren als er vragen over rijzen.

Verder zullen we nog meer dan we nu al doen de kernwaarden van onze journalistiek intern uidragen en verder werken aan een open cultuur waarin redacteuren elkaar openlijk

onderling bevragen over de totstandkoming van stukken en van de journalistieke werkwijze. Die werkwijze zal ook vast onderdeel worden van de jaarlijkse functioneringsgesprekken tussen redactiechefs en hun redacteuren.

We hebben inmiddels contact gelegd met een extern vertrouwenspersoon die redacteuren kunnen bellen als ze een lastige klus hebben gedaan of een traumatische ervaring hebben meegemaakt. We hopen en verwachten dat zo'n persoon voor redacteuren als een uitlaatklep kan dienen en traumatische ervaringen of oververmoeidheid na zware klussen kan verminderen danwel eerder kan signaleren.

Tenslotte hebben we voor alle redactiechefs een handleiding beschikbaar gesteld hoe zij oververmoeidheid, stress en burnout-verschijnselen eerder kunnen herkennen bij hun redacteuren. Ook tips voor het voorkomen van burnout is onderdeel van die handleiding.

**Auteurs:**

Elske Schouten, chef Buitenland

Egbert Kalse, adjunct-hoofdredacteur

## Bijlagen bij het definitieve onderzoek naar artikelen van Oscar Garschagen

### BIJLAGE 1:

**Van:** Charles Zhang [mailto:[chaoqunchung@XXXXXX](mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXXX)]

**Verzonden:** zondag 3 september 2017 13:10

**Aan:** E-mail Sorteerders <[E-mailSorteerders@nrcmedia.onmicrosoft.com](mailto:E-mailSorteerders@nrcmedia.onmicrosoft.com)>

**Onderwerp:** Exposing a NRC journalist's serious news fabrication

**Urgentie:** Hoog

To Sjoerd de Jong, NRC Ombudsman, and editors in NRC

Hi,

This is Zhang Chaoqun, the news assistant in NRC's Shanghai bureau. I don't if you know my existence or not, but I have worked for NRC's resident-correspondent Oscar Garschagen since July, 2015. And I found he has been fabricating news reports at a very serious level since than, and I am writing to you today to expose his serious news fabrications. There are many examples, but I will just list eight examples with some evidences. If you want to investigate the case, please contact with me.

1.

In late 2015, he wanted to write a report about the elder suicidal phenomenon in China. I found two reports about elders who run away from home to suicide after being diagnosed with serious diseases: one was about elder Wang Bingzhang from Huian, Fujian, the other was about elder Xia Jumao from Yangzhou, Jiangsu. Finally, the two stories were spliced into one story in his report published in November: elder Wang Bingzhang who was found dead in Zhangpu, Fujian was found dead in Yangtze area where elder Xia Jumao died; and the note left by elder Xia Jumao was described as written by elder Wang Bingzhang in the report. These two stories are actually from domestic news, but he didn't mention that, the whole story seems like a result of his own interview work.

Link of the report: <https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2015/11/05/oud-in-china-ik-wil-niet-tot-last-zijn-dus-ik-sp-1552937-a591652>

Fabrication skill no. 1: Sometimes, you can copy and splice reports from other media to fabricate your own reports, don't always fabricate reports from zero ground.

(please see attached "Elder suicidal email" )

2.

In June, 2016, as the South China Sea Arbitration Case caught more and more attention, with the idea of visiting a maritime militia, he went to Tanmen town, Qionghai city, Hainan. Wang Shumao, deputy company commander of the maritime militia in Tanmen town was his interview objective, but Mr. Wang directly declined the interview. It didn't matter, in the report published later, he said he waited for three days and finally "interviewed" Mr. Wang with the arrangement from the publicity department in Hainan province. Of course, the interview didn't happen at all. At the end of the report, he said Mr. Wang "is a member of the organization that builds the first South China Sea Museum at the port" , but I didn't find this information anywhere.

Maybe he felt the content of one interview was not rich enough, he then named a captain as “Feng Ruibo” who we interviewed in Tanmen but actually only gave us his surname. He made the captain told a story he actually had never told: he often carries some cement, steel and wood to the Xisha Islands and Nansha Islands in South China Sea when he goes to the fishing grounds in those areas, and described this as “fulfilling patriotic duty”. His fabrication didn’t end in there, with his magic pen, he “ate” with the captain who came with a BMW car he actually didn’t have in a restaurant called Bafang Haiwei. Besides, he also “drawn” for the captain a fishing boat with hull mark Qionghai Dongfang 200011 which the captain actually didn’t have(if a fishing boat’s hull number is Qionghai Dongfang, it is a boat from Dongfang city, Hainan, not Qionghai city, Hainan. And the number is usually 5 of digits, not 6. A good fabrication, but not good enough). I don’t know if the captain will ask the journalist to invite him a real meal in Bafang Haiwei, to give him a real BMW car and a real fishing boat, if he knows all these fabrications.

Link of the report: <https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2016/07/08/vissers-en-veroveraars-3147670-a1510278>

Fabrication skill no. 2: Even though people can turn down your interview or don’t say something you want to hear, but you can make them docile and obedient in your reports, they will speak whatever you want them to speak. If they speak well, you can reward them with virtual gifts.

3.

In December, 2015, he followed a National Public Radio(NPR) report(<http://www.npr.org/sections/parallels/2015/09/16/440822077/a-sense-of-crisis-now-in-a-chinese-boomtown-gone-bust>) and went to Lvliang, Shanxi. During two days’ stay in there, he went to Lvliang Airport, Datuhe coal mine and Zhongfen Liquor City which were mentioned in the NPR report. But in his own report, the story mainly happened in Chuandong Cement Factory, a place NPR journalist visited but we didn’t. The NPR report mentioned a home appliance store with a bad business, he also copied that part into his report, but he actually didn’t visit the store, he didn’t even know where the store was!

Link of the report: <https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2016/01/07/achter-de-facade-loopt-china-vast-1573850-a191145>

Fabrication skill no. 3: You should not only copy and splice reports from Chinese media, but also take references from reports made by foreign media peers when necessary.

4.

In May, 2017, as the Belt and Road Forum was about to start, he went to Horgos, Xinjiang, an important port in China’s opening-up to the west. Due to a tight schedule, he only visited China-Kazakhstan International Border Cooperation Center. During his entry and exit of the center, he was questioned by immigration officers, and this made him very upset, in his report about the trip, he said “free travel has certainly become impossible for non-Han-Chinese”, but the fact was totally different: during the queuing for the entry and exit, there were many people from minority ethnic groups with different faces and languages in front of and behind him, but it seemed he didn’t see that.

Sometimes, his eyes can’t see things they saw, but they sometimes can see things they didn’t see. Due to some unknown reason, he said in his report that “on the roof of a 5-star hotel under construction in Horgos, there are even snipers”! During the visit in Horgos, I was always with him, but I had never seen, nor heard from him a scene like this. Maybe he saw this scene from his “tinted glasses”?

Link of the report: <https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/05/12/alle-wegen-leiden-naar-beijing-8869028-a1558411>

Fabrication skill no. 4: To see or not to see, the key is not your eyes, but your heart.

(The journalist also completely fabricated a Horgos government official's quote: "De situatie in Xinjiang is gespannen en wij willen iedereen een gevoel van veiligheid geven", erkent partijbaas Guo. Hij weet dat er geen Chinese investeerder zijn kant uit komt als er niet op iedere hoek een politiepost staat en het leger niet zichtbaar patrouilleert, dag en nacht." Please see attached "Horgos interview" )

5.

In December, 2016, for the coverage of a criminal case in which a Dutch citizen was involved, he asked me to call Wang Fu, the Dutch citizen's lawyer from Shengyun Law Firm in Beijing and made an 8 minutes telephonic interview. The final report only had one quote from lawyer Wang, "It's obviously not a fair trial," said the lawyer. But in the 8 minutes telephonic interview, that was the only sentence the lawyer didn't say.

Link of the report: <https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2016/12/08/geen-bewijs-toch-twaalf-jaar-chinese-cel-5703982-a1535641>

Fabrication skill no. 5: The quantity of quotes is not important, a good fabricated quote alone can also work.

(Please see attached "Dutch citizen's lawyer", Oscar wrongly spelt the lawyer's name in the report)

6.

In July, 2017, he made a report about domestic violence in China. The victim couldn't divorce her husband due to his high compensation demand, but at the end of that report, he said, a few days after the interview, the victim "said" the negotiations(conciliation) have been completed, and she and her family will pay 9000 Euros to the family of her violent ex-husband. But the fact is: on August 28th , the victim told me via Wechat that "there will be a hearing of my case tomorrow...probably there will not be a judgment in court" . This journalist with far-reaching super-natural power passed a judgment for the case in his report long before the Chinese judges do in the court! Unbelievable, isn't it?

Link of the report: <https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/07/12/xiaoping-was-bijna-gewurgd-voordat-ze-kon-scheiden-11330288-a1566344>

Fabrication skill no. 6: Don't get restricted by your occupation as a journalist, you can play anyone in your report, a judge, for example.

7.

After the visit in Tanmen town, he went to Danzhou city, Hainan to cover Evergrande Group's construction of Sea Flower Artificial Island. He had a look outside the construction site and listened the brief introduction of the project from a salesperson in the sales center, then we went to the railway station and headed to Haikou city, Hainan. I didn't understand what his purpose was in there, but when the report was published, I was stunned: he said he interviewed two house buyers in the sales center,

Leng Chaoqun and his wife Stephanie Leng. Wait! Chaoqun? Isn't this my name? I was surprised and sighed, after helping him in so many reports, he never added my name in the end of a report, saying “Zhang Chaoqun contributed to this report” , but he unexpectedly use my name for a fictional character in his report! Should I be happy, or should I be sad?

Link of the report: <https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2016/12/27/in-paradijselijk-hainan-zijn-ze-nerveus-over-de-zeepbellen-5881888-a1538573>

Fabrication skill no. 7: The journalist said, "let there be a story," and there was a story.

8.

In January 2017, several central departments jointly announced the results of a national golf course rectification campaign. He wanted to make a report about golf and anti-corruption, then he went to Sheshan Golf Club in Shanghai, but was refused to enter by the guards in there because he was not a club member. But this didn't obstruct his news fabrication process, in the report published later, he had not only successfully “interviewed” a caddie named Wang Yu in there, but also “heard” an interesting story from him: the caddie heard from his colleagues that Xi Jinping who was the party secretary of Shanghai played golf in the course in 2007. And at the beginning of his report, he said “in China it is a public secret that president and party leader Xi Jinping is not a bad amateur golfer” . He didn't only fabricate an interview in Sheshan Golf Club, but also a public secret in China. Good job!

He also “interviewed” professor Han Liebao from Beijing Forestry University in the report. The curious thing is, he wrongly spelt professor Han's name as “Han Lie” . Finally, I found the reason was because I also wrongly spelt the professor's name as “Han Lie” in a document he asked me to prepare about quotes from golf experts about the rectification results in domestic media, and he copied the wrong name during his fabrication of the report. Sorry, boss, my carelessness made you copy the wrong name.

Link of the report: <https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/01/26/chinese-goudmijnen-sluiten-massaal-6410604-a1543151>

Fabrication skill no. 8: To fabricate an interesting report, you can make rumors about anyone, including but not limited to leaders of China.

(Please see attached a file “Golf course rectification” about golf course rectification I prepared for Oscar, the main point is professor Han Liebao's wrongly spelt name)

--

Regards  
Chaoqun  
Mobile: 1851XXXXXXX  
NRC Handelsblad Shanghai Bureau

## BIJLAGE 2

Another 2 elders run away from home after being diagnosed with cancer in 2014

"Charles Zhang" <chaoqunchung@XXXXXXX>

"o.garschagen@XXXXXX" <收件人 : o.garschagen@XXXXXXX>

抄送 : "ogarschagen@XXXXXXXX" <ogarschagen@XXXXXXXX>

时间 : 2015-11-2 17:36:35

附件 :

In the morning of June 22nd, 72 years old Wang Bingzhang run away from home in Huian county, Quanzhou city,

Fujian province and left a note:

I have got a serious disease, the attending doctor said no matter how much money we put in(the treatment), there is

no guarantee that I will get cured. I am already more than 70 years old, I feel there is no need to have treatment, I

don't want to add any burden to our family, so I plan to go to a place far away and end my life myself. Please don't

look for my body or post people searching notice in newspaper, they are both a waste of money.

In rural area, a

funeral will cost tens of thousands RMB, no other people will pay this for my sons, I don't want to be their burden,

the only thing I can do is to end my life myself. -- Your father

After running away from home, he called his younger daughter and said he had left a suicide note which is placed

on the desk in his bedroom. He emphasized in the note that there is no need to look for him.

His body was found in the sea by a fisherman in Zhangpu couty, Zhangzhou city, Fujian province, 237km away from

his home.

Wang's 73 years old wife is still alive.

Wang felt uncomfortable in the spring festival 2014, he went to check his health in a hospital and doctor told him it is

probably esophagus cancer and not necessarily can be cured. And Mr. Wang hide this from his family and didn't seek treatment.

His son died at 47 years old in April 2013. This could be another heavy blow to him. His personality changed a lot after that.

---

---

---

On October 25th, 2014, 75 years old Xia Jumao from Yangzhou city left his rented room. He was diagnosed with

lung cancer at terminal stage in early 2014, his body were found on 29th, the death cause is drowning.

He has an adopted daughter called Jingjing(a pseudonym) and has raised her for more than 20 years. Jingjing hide

the diagnosis to Xia Jumao and finally Xia got very sick in August 2014 and knew the truth from Jingjing.

The adopted parents moved with Jingjing from Heilongjiang to Yangzhou when she was 5 to 6 years old. They are not rich.

Xia left a note to Jingjing, saying he knew he won't live long in this world and asked Jingjing to lead a good life and

don't look for him. Besides, Xia left his valuable stuffs such as watch and wallet to Jingjing, and reminding her "the water and electricity bills have been paid".

--

Regards  
Chaoqun

**BIJLAGE 3:**

**From:** "Charles Zhang" <[chaoqunchung@XXXXX](mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXX)>  
**To:** "Jong, Sjoerd de" <[s.dejong@XXXXXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXXXX)>  
**Cc:** "E-mail Sorteerders" <[E-mailSorteerders@nrcmedia.onmicrosoft.com](mailto:E-mailSorteerders@nrcmedia.onmicrosoft.com)>  
**Subject: Some evidences of Oscar Garschagen's News Fabrication**

Hi,

I have contacted some people who were quoted in Mr. Oscar Garschagen's reports, and have got their formal responses, please find attached the PDF printing files of our communication emails.

Big data and social credit system: <https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/03/13/big-brother-meets-big-data-7073575-a1550087>

1. Professor Zhou Tao:

"Most of the journalist's description of my work is interpretation out of context, some of them is completely fabricated."

我们一共分析了18960名电子科技大学在校生的行为数据，这些数据是严格匿名化的，我们并不知道每个ID后面的学生是谁。

分析结果已经向社会公开，可以查看我们公开的研究报 <https://arxiv.org/abs/1704.04103>

这个文章已经投往美国科学院院刊，刚刚拿到第一轮审稿意见，没有出现任何科学伦理学的质疑和问题，因为分析过程匿名化，所公布的统计结果也无法重现任何个人隐私信息。

该记者对我们工作的描述大部分都是断章取义，有的完全是编造的，例如我们没有在广东进行过任何实验，我都怀疑广东有没有200万在校大学生，这个编造也太假了，哈哈哈。

严格执行保护个人隐私是科学研究，特别是涉及人的生命科学和社会行为研究的基本准则。

2. The office in Political Science department at Tsinghua University spoke on behalf of Professor Meng Tianguang:

"So far as I know, professor Meng Tianguang never accepted interview from foreign media, he also didn't accept interview from Dutch media."

“据我所知，孟天广教授从不接受外媒采访，更没有接受过荷兰外媒的采访，针对类似邮件，后续我们不予再回复。”

3. Golf course rectification: <https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/01/26/chinese-goudmijnen-sluiten-massaal-6410604-a1543151>

"I didn't know you, the newspaper and the journalist you mentioned in the email, I never accepted an interview from this journalist or you about the golf policy in China."

“今天在邮箱里突然看到你发给我的邮件，很惊讶，我并不认识你及你邮件中所提到了这份荷兰报纸和这个记者，我从来没有接受过这个记者和你关于中国高尔夫政策的采访，对文中提到的所谓我的观点，我从来也没有这样表述过，今天我也是第一次看到。我所在的机构是“北京林业大学高尔夫教育与研究中心”，我的英文名字“Han lie bait”（a typo the professor later corrected to Han liebao），不是 “Han lie”！从我本人来讲，一直以来，我从不接受电话或邮件或其他方式的采访，我只接受面对面的采访！这家媒体的任何人我都没有接受过任何方式的采访！”

Hope I can hear a sincere response from your side soon.

--  
Regards  
Chaoqun

Mobile: 1851XXXXXXX

#### **BIJLAGE 4**

"Charles Zhang" <chaoqunchung@XXXXXX>  
"o.garschagen@XXXXXXXX" <收件人 : o.garschagen@XXXXXX>  
抄送 : "ogarschagen@XXXXXXXXXX" <ogarschagen@XXXXXX>  
时间 : 2017-5-5 17:29:44  
附件 :

Transcript of Interview with Guo Jianbin, Deputy Director of Administrative Committee of Horgos Economic Development Zone

*On May 4th, 2017*

In 2013, party general secretary Xi proposed the concept of "the belt and road" which has been supported by people around the world in the past 3 years.

For Horgos' participation in the construction of the "belt and road" initiative, we have finished the construction of the infrastructure, laying a solid foundation of the taking off of the economic construction of "silk road". In 2015, we

finished the inspection and acceptance of the vehicle import gateway, grain import gateway and meat import gateway, railway gateway which have been done by China Customs and General Administration of Quality

Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine, and the construction supporting area of the International Border

Cooperation Center(IBCC), these have laid a solid foundation for the social and economic development in Horgos,

and the comprehensive services to the construction of "the belt and road".

For the construction of IBCC, we have basically finished the construction of utilities, such as water, electricity,

heating, traffic, greening, illumination, 1.17 billion RMB investment has been made for these.

They have laid a solid foundation for the development of IBCC.

The objective of the construction of Horgos is called "the pilot area of 4 ports and 1 valley": international financial

port, international logistics port, international information port, international aerial port, and international tourism

valley which features border tourism.

And for the projects in future, after the construction of those gateways I just introduced, we plan to connect

Rotterdam in the Netherlands, Duisberg in Germany with China and realize the vehicle import.

Also, exporting

Chinese goods to Rotterdam, some China-Europe trains also go to Rotterdam. There will be import of milk powder,

red wine from Europe, many European characteristic products are already sold in IBCC. Yes, red wine can be

imported into China. (*there were reports about the import of Spanish red wine, olive oil and dairy products via China-Europe trains*)

These are about the prospects of the development in highway and railway. From Rotterdam to Horgos, by highway,

it is 10 to 12 days, via the 10800km long West-West Highway(Western Europe to Western China). The

transportation by rail is similar with highway transportation. In the future, products like beef, mutton from Europe and

Russia can be imported into Horgos in big quantity via highway and railway.

Transcript of Interview with Guo Jianbin, Deputy Director of Administrative Co

mmittee of Horgos Economic Development Zone

After the approval of the grain import gateway, a labor intensive industry about soybean and wheat deep processing

has been formed in the supporting area of IBCC. Grains are imported from Kazakhstan, processed in China as

fodder, instant noodles, wholegrain foods and soy oil.

Horgos faces domestic and international markets both.

(Why Hubei is not investing in Chinese side?)

According to the concept of the "belt and road", big companies are encouraged to participate in the construction of

infrastructure in the countries along the "belt and road" to improve the infrastructure level in those areas; the second

is because China is already connected with the world. In your case, it must be that those companies from Hubei

want to take advantage of their own technologies or characteristics in Hubei to match the demand and need with

some area in Kazakhstan. Also to avoid the import duty if they can produce products in Kazakhstan.

(Airport)

The airport project has been listed in the 13th 5-year plans of the country and Xinjiang Uighur Autonomous Region.

The site selection and feasible research have been passed, now in the procedure of argumentation and waiting for

the approval of Civil Aviation Administration of China(CAAC). The airport will be completed within 3 years(before

2020). The airport is constructed with 3C standard and its runway is 2400m long. It is a all-weather commuter

airport. We want to make this airport an bonded aerial port to give the cheapest, fastest and most convenient air

service to bulk duty-free products inside IBCC. For example, if there is not an aerial port in Horgos, cargo from

Spain and other European countries usually start to gather in Duisberg or Rotterdam and then be transported by

train or trucks to Horgos, the waiting time may takes about 10 days, and transportation will takes another 10 days, a

batch of cargo may will takes 1 to 2 months to get here. But with this aerial port, a cargo plane can come to Horgos

from Rotterdam or Duisberg within 4 to 5 hours and those cargo will be immediately transferred to our duty-free

markets. So you can also call it an international airport.

Homogeneous competition between airport and railway or highway doesn't exist. For example, cargo transported

from Rotterdam to Chongqing or Lianyuangang, Jiangsu by train just pass through Horgos, Horgos doesn't play as a

distribution center. This is why we call it a "great railway passage".

For highway transportation, about 90% to 100% of them come from Kazakhstan to import cargo from China. The

distance of highway transportation is short, but the delivery time and safety can't be guaranteed, if some inspection

equipment get broken, then these cargo will be delayed for 5 or 6 days.

For the freight, we also have made some research. For sea transportation, there are distribution places, such as

Dubai, Rotterdam and Duisberg. But for railway transportation, there is not a similar big distribution place like those

in railway transportation constructed by any country in the world.

(Economic foundation for the development of Horgos in the future is Horgos' role as a distribution center?) It is a

part of that. For example, we will also make Horgos a duty-free shopping paradise. We are actively discussing with the ministry of transport and National Development and Reform Commission(NDRC) about the construction of a state demonstration base of multi-modal transport, we are planning to apply for this project in this year. From sea port to railway, from railway to highway, we want to make Horgos a demonstration base of this multi-modal transport.

(Why does it take so long for truck transportation? Do you have plan to increase this efficiency?) We are planning to increase the efficiency.

One idea of the "belt and road" initiative is to help the infrastructure construction in the countries along the "belt and

road". After 26 years since its founding, Kazakhstan has a stable political situation, people's life is relatively rich, but

its infrastructure is poor. It is 378km from Horgos to Almaty, in China, a distance like this usually takes 3.5 hours

drive, but in Kazakstan, the road condition in there may can't compare with our rural highway.

There customs

clearance equipment in Kazakhstan is also advanced, but their inspection and examination model is complex, and

truck transportation distribution area is too narrow, its infrastructure is basically zero. According to the agreement

between two countries, the customs in China is 7days/12hours, but it causes a big pressure in Kazakhstan side,

there is not enough space for parking, and the inspection and examination procedure is complex, therefore the

speed becomes slow. But we are solving this problem. As the West-West Highway is about to be wholly connected,

we have constructed a 6th generation gateway with 640 million RMB investment in the connection point of West-

West Highway. The gateway will be put into use on December 16th this year. The designed capacity of highway

transportation is 5 million ton per year, and 3 million person times per year. It will be the biggest land port in China

after its completion. After the use of the 6th generation of the gateway, according to the agreement between China

and Kazakhstan, the old gateway will be closed.

When the West-West Highway which has 6 lanes is connected, the distance from Almaty from Horgos is 305km and

2.5 hours drive.

(Security situation is sensitive in Xinjiang, will that prevent it from becoming a new gateway?) No, it will not cause

influence.

(I don't understand duty-free shopping center)

IBCC was started based on a cooperation frame signed by leaders from China and Kazakhstan in 2006, central

government has given it many favorable policies in the past 10 years.

(China side is big, Kazakhstan side is small)

Our side is 3.43 sqkm(1.5sqkm has been constructed), Kazakhstan side is 1.85 sqkm, 5.28 sqkm in total. We call it

the first and only project of its kind in China and the world.

IBCC aims at international and domestic markets both. For international market, because Kazakhstan doesn't have

a strong light industry, even though it has heavy industry such as oil and steel which are left by Soviet Union. In the

production of shoes, socks, cooking ware, etc., their technology and equipment are relatively backward. Products

exported from IBCC to Kazakhstan are tyres, bedding cloth, garment, textile, etc.. Especially during Christmas,

there is a big purchase, for example from Russia. The trade amount in last year was 600 million USD. The sales revenue in duty-free shops are not included, actually 80% to 85% of them were contributed by Chinese citizens.

That 600 million USD was trade of textiles, shoes, hats, etc.

(only a few variety of production in Kazakhstan, much more in China side)

Yes, you are right. I want to explain why build so many trade markets in here since there are already so many in

Urumqi. A Kazakhs businessman has to wait for a long time for a visa if he wants to do business in China, but in

IBCC, Kazakhs citizen can enter with only their ID cards, no requirement of visas; besides, trade from Almaty to

Urumqi or Yiwu, Zhejiang, they all done by flights, the cost is very high.

In 2014, the entry into IBCC by Chinese citizens was 1.8 million person times. In 2015, 3.6 million person times. In

2016, 5 million person times. They come from all across China.

(Why do they come here from such a long distance?)

Tourism in Xinjiang increased a lot in the past couple of years. In Ili Kazakhs prefecture, the tourists number was 20

million person times in last year. Horgos is part of this tour as a cross-border duty-free shopping experience center.

Duty-free products from Europe are much cheaper than Beijing or Shanghai, for example, a bottle of Dior's perfume

for male is sold at 1500RMB to 1600RMB in those cities, but in IBCC, the price is 700RMB to 800RMB. Chinese

citizens can buy maximum 8000RMB duty-free products per person, per day.

(Our impression of Chinese citizens' shopping of duty-free products outside IBCC)

Those stacks of products outside IBCC as you saw yesterday was actually to let people have full enjoyment of this

8000RMB duty-free shopping quota. We want to enhance the trade between the two countries, and the prices of

products from Kazakhstan are not high, they are just things which for people's ordinary life. In order to enhance the

sales, we plan to cooperate with Customs and establish a centralized transportation center in June, when people

buy lots of things, they just need to declare them in customs, if they fits the requirement of below 8000RMB, these

things will be transported out by vehicles, or sent to an address inside China as the buyer required. In this way,

Customs can know well about the exact daily trade amount of duty-free products. (This is in consistent with the idea

of distribution center)

(How to get the return of investment after such a massive investment?)

9 projects have been completed in IBCC, the total investment is between 8 billion RMB to 10 billion RMB, that 1.17

billion RMB investment for utilities is not included. And 95% of these investment are made by private enterprises.

For example, Golden Gateway is invested by a company from Wuhan, Hubei; Golden Port(Jin'gang) International

Fur Market is invested by a company from Yiwu, Zhejiang; Zhongke International is invested by a company from

Wuxi, Jiangsu; Yiwu Trade Market which has 120 000sqm area is also invested by a private company. Shops in

these markets were sold at 3700RMB per sqm averagely when I was transferred to here in 2014(*previously as a deputy*

*mayor in Kuitun, Xinjiang*), now the price has been increased to 15000RMB to 16000RMB per sqm.

People look further

increase of the limited land resources of this first and only project of its kind in China and the world, it is only 5.28sqkm and won't grow bigger, they are also optimistic about the prospect of the cooperation between China and Kazakhstan, and central Asia. IBCC is a pilot zone about the connections of economy between two countries, including the exchange and communication of person, materials, capital, etc. (How this area will be connected with Euro-Asia Customs Union proposed by Russian president Putin?) It is a tariffs union. It doesn't have big influence on this area. But this union has certain influence on the free trade between countries. A uniform standard and a uniform tariff rate are implemented inside this union, the trade of daily necessities in this area, especially in middle Asia will be influenced, but the influence is only on the land and railway gateways. And IBCC is not an ordinary gateway. In land and railway gateways, you can't travel freely without a visa. But you can enter IBCC just with your passport and stay for as long as 29 days, and you can come again the next day, it is not like a highway or railway gateways which are strictly managed. (Hubei company invests in Kazakhstan and its products can flow freely inside the union without paying import duty, right?) Yes. (Attracting tourists to Xinjiang while its security situation is still sensitive must not be an easy task) Based on our experiences in the past 2 years, stability maintenance and the tourism development actually supplement each other. The more stable this place is, the more tourists it will attract. (Financial center project?) An important function of IBCC is the pilot project of offshore RMB and cross-border RMB business. PBoC gives us this mission. We treat IBCC as an area inside the territory, but outside the customs, banks inside IBCC enjoy the rights as foreign banks. We will build a Wallstreet in western China inside IBCC, it will be the biggest highlight of IBCC. We are actively discussing national banks in Kazakhstan about the possibility of the exchange and hedge between RMB and Tenge inside IBCC. (The biggest highlights will be train, truck distribution centers and financial project, and duty-free shopping center is only a smaller part) Right, you see this whole industry structure clearly. There are 7 special economic development zones in China, Horgos economic development zone is one of them. And Horgos zone's mission is to realize great channel, great logistics, great trade. As the Horgos develops, it needs a platform which can supply public services such as health, employment, infrastructure, etc. for traders and people live in here, and this zone will be engine for the development of whole Horgos city. The city will be used for the connection with central Asia and the construction and development in countries along the "belt and road". After the establishment of Horgos government, government must play its role in supplying public service, and the economic development zone will focus on the economic development. Shenzhen was only a small fishing village, after 30 years development, it now has tens of millions population. Horgos will be the same. We launched a slogan, "if you missed Shenzhen first, and later missed Shanghai Pudong,

then don't miss Horgos!" We have this confidence and capability in making contributions for the trade with and construction in the countries along the silk road.

Pudong was called a miracle of China, and we believe the development of Horgos in future shall make itself a miracle in western China. Horgos has drew a beautiful manuscript with pencil, we hope people and countries along the "belt and road" will help build Horgos into a colorful city with their wit and labor.

(Building Horgos will be harder than Shenzhen and Pudong)

You are right. We know these difficulties clearly in our hearts, but our confidence of development doesn't reduce.

(Biggest challenge in future?)

We feel the biggest challenges in the future are several parts. First the economic globalization will definitely spread

to Horgos; second, fair trade and the sharing and co-building are the dynamic for the development in Horgos in

future, they are also the most basic foundation for reaching a consensus between countries along the "belt and

road"; third, infrastructure creates a good condition for the travel and logistics for countries along the "belt and road".

And the key point is, the connection and communication of cultures and the public between countries along the "belt

and road", people in these countries should find a common sense of identity.

I came back from Xinyuan, via Yining to Horgos to meet you this morning, there are beautiful tulips in blossom along

the way. I was told yesterday that you are Dutch, and I was thinking, what is "the belt and road", what is tulip, then I

remember tulip is from the Netherlands. And why tulip is the state flower of the Netherlands?

Because this colorful

flower always grows upward and faces towards the sky and sun, then I realized Dutch people like sunshine. They

must chose tulip as their state flower for a reason. And when you come here, I told you there are tulips in Horgos,

and you told me you have noticed them. See, this is what I call the communication and understanding of culture and

the public. And our conversation today is very pleasant.

(Is backlash of anti-globalization a challenge?)

I feel protectionism and anti-globalization is just a trend, they haven't developed to a stage that can handicapped the

global economic development. No one can leave alone without others in current world economy, flower is a main

industry in the Netherlands, lots of tulips are exported to other countries from the Netherlands each year, but

protectionism will affect every country. We advocate free trade, because protectionism will break the chain of global

economy into pieces. Countries in the world shouldn't behave like toll gates in the highway of world economy, but

should be a cleaner under the dominance of governments, and remove stones and barriers to keep this economic

passage clean. We should be cleaners, rather than toll collectors.

I hope Horgos will be introduced to Dutch people via your reports and you will come back once a year to see its change.

--

Regards

Chaoqun

Mobile: 1851XXXXXXXX

NRC Handelsblad Shanghai Bureau

**BIJLAGE 5:**

**Van:** Charles Zhang [mailto:[chaoqunchung@XXXXXXX](mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXXXX)]

**Verzonden:** woensdag 13 september 2017 12:51

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXXXX)>; Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXXXX)>

**CC:** E-mail Sorteerders <[E-mailSorteerders@nrcmedia.onmicrosoft.com](mailto:E-mailSorteerders@nrcmedia.onmicrosoft.com)>

**Onderwerp:** Official response from the publicity department in Horogs, Xijiang

Dear Ms. Elske, Mr. Jong,

I have got the official response from the publicity department in Horgos, Xinjiang about my request for fact checking in NRC correspondent Oscar Garschagen's Alle wegen leiden naar Peking(<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/05/12/alle-wegen-leiden-naar-beijing-8869028-a1558411>), please find attached their email in PDF and the transcript of the interview with the government official in Horgos.

In their response, they said, some quote and descriptions in the report are purely fabricated:

1. "De situatie in Xinjiang is gespannen en wij willen iedereen een gevoel van veiligheid geven", erkent partijbaas Guo. Hij weet dat er geen Chinese investeerder zijn kant uit komt als er niet op iedere hoek een politiepost staat en het leger niet zichtbaar patrouilleert, dag en nacht."
2. "Op het dak van een vijfsterrenhotel in aanbouw in Horgos staan zelfs sluipschutters."
3. "Hij staat erop zijn „nieuwste bron van trots" te laten zien en snelt vooruit in zijn dienstauto, een zwarte Audi 6."
4. "Vrij reizen is zeker voor niet-Han-Chinezen onmogelijk geworden."

The contact in the publicity department in Horgos is Mr. Chen Jianing(陈佳宁), his phone number is: 1502XXXXXXX. By the way, I am not sure if he speaks English, and there is a 2-hour time gap between Horgos and Beijing time, but only uses Beijing time is used in Horgos.

I am looking forward to hearing your soon reply about the investigation results of this case.

--

Regards

Chaoqun

Mobile: 1851XXXXXX

**BIJLAGE 6:**

"Charles Zhang" <chaoqunchung@XXXXXXX>  
"o.garschagen@XXXXXXXXX" <收件人 : o.garschagen@XXXXXXX>  
抄送 : "ogarschagen@XXXXXXX" <ogarschagen@XXXXXXXXXX>  
时间 : 2016-12-8 12:32:41  
附件 :

Transcript of the telephonic interview about a Dutch citizen's 12 years sentence with lawyer Wang Fu from Beijing

Shengyun Law Firm

(When will be the verdict of the appeal case?)

According to the law, the verdict will be announced with 2 to 3 months after the day the case is accepted. For some

difficult and complex cases, a high court can report to supreme court to apply for an extension which doesn't have a

time limit requirement in law. Currently, we didn't see any extension application documents from the high court, but

the possibility of an extension application can not be excluded.

I am not sure when the (appeal) case was accepted by high court, because I took the case after its acceptance. But

it is almost 3 months after the case was accepted. I am not sure the exact date when the case was accepted, so I

can't give you an accurate answer, I think the verdict will be announced soon, because it is almost 3 months. But if

there is an extension, it will be longer to have a verdict.

(So before the end of 2016?)

Yes. But we can't exclude the possibility of an extension application from the high court to supreme court.

(Dutch government intervention will be helpful or not?)

I don't know how Dutch government will get involved into this case. But based on my understanding of the Beijing

high court, I am cautiously optimistic about the verdict of the appeal case.

Yes, I am cautiously optimistic about the case. We have submitted various kinds of applications to the high court and

it didn't respond yet. But according to my knowledge, since I am a lawyer in Beijing, I personally recognize the

procedures in the Beijing high court.

(Did you meet with your client?)

We have met in the detention house for 4 times.

(How is he doing?)

It was evening time when the case happened, according to our analysis, the decedent may fell off the rooftop

accidentally. This is our analysis based on proofs.

But the case happened in evening, my client initially didn't know how the decedent fell off the rooftop, but he thought

he is innocent. And during the appeal case, after we analyzed the disputes, he is more certain about that and said in

the court that he is innocent.

Transcript of the telephonic interview about a Dutch citizen's 12 years sentence with lawyer Wang Fu

(Physically and mentally?)

He is fine. Because the living conditions in the detention house is good, and police's management is civilized and

give him good care.

(Strange aspects of the case?)

I recommend your journalist to read my pleadings and catalog of proofs which I have given to the family member of my client, these documents have made clear about all law violations in the whole case.  
(Will high court not address the mistakes because these are mistakes made by police?)  
I personally think there is no such problem. After all, it is an ordinary criminal case. The verdicts of criminal cases in China in recent years are becoming more and more just. I don't deny the high court may will face some resistance,  
but I think they can overcome it.  
(Do police make similar mistakes in other criminal cases?)  
I think it is very rare.  
I am grateful for your appeal of this case, I hope there will be a good result finally.

--

Regards  
Chaoqun  
Mobile: 1851XXXXXXXX  
NRC Handelsblad Shanghai Bureau

## **BIJLAGE 7:**

Transcript of the interview with a domestic violence victim on June 3rd

"Charles Zhang" <chaoqunchung@XXXXXXX>

"o.garschagen@XXXXXXX" <收件人 : o.garschagen@XXXXXXX>

抄送 : "ogarschagen@XXXXXXX" <ogarschagen@XXXXXXX>

时间 : 2017-6-6 22:43:45

附件 :

*The woman Lin Xiaojing(a pseudonym she gave me) was born in 1989, her ex-husband Mr. Chen was a few months younger than her.*

*Lin works as an accountant at a university in Lin'an, Zhejiang. She is now also studying as a post graduate. Her ex-husband's job is also accountant. Lin has a younger sister, Chen is the only son in his family.*

*It was a flash marriage. From the time we knew each other to the marriage registration, it was only about 15 days*

*and we had only one meal outside. We knew each other in a date chat-room when we were 26 years old(December*

*2014). In that year, lots of friends and classmates of mine got married, one after another, and that made me anxious,*

*because I didn't want to be left behind by others in anything, and my mother also urged me to get married.*

*Previously my family introduced me some men who had very good conditions, for example, one of them was a*

*Zhejiang University graduate with a good job, but I didn't have the plan for marriage so I refused them.*

*The second half of a year is usually the peak time for wedding, and my mother's urge also made me worried, it was*

*a big influence in that circumstances. I started to browse some date websites. and read his data post and thought he*

*was okay. Then we started to chat and date, and we both felt good about each other, as you know, people just show*

*their best sides to others in this kind of date. He wanted to get married, so did I. I didn't want to marry a man who*

*was younger than me, because I didn't want a "younger brother", he was actually a few months younger than me but*

*told me that we were of the same age.*

*Even though we wanted to get married, but I thought we still needed consent from our parents.*

*So I went to his*

*home and he visited my parents later, and then we registered marriage.(December 25th, 2014)*

*Our parents didn't*

*know the marriage was a flash one, we couldn't let them know that. We just told them that we actually had known*

*each other for a long time, the reason I didn't tell them the truth was the worry of being blamed, they might will say*

*the marriage was not good because it was a flash marriage. For me, it was just like a bet. I was in a marriageable*

*age but without a mate, then there came up such a person who seemed okay, maybe a good marriage was*

*possible. It was not that difficult to find a boyfriend for me, but I was like possessed by a ghost and just felt good*

*about him. In retrospection, I think to myself, how could I take a fancy to such a man? But in that time, I was naive*

*and didn't have many social experiences. In my impression, he was a very honest tall man(a man who doesn't play tricks*

*with others), his honest temper also attracted me. I was short and wanted to find a tall husband, and he had a fair skin*

and a not bad looking, he was qualified first in appearances. His voice was very low when he spoke, if felt like he was a man who couldn't make a decision and would consult with you in everything. That made me feel he was like a younger brother, not a suitable person to marry. But he kept pursuing me, and I thought he worked as an accountant, and his parents were okay and had a big apartment, he didn't have bad habit such as smoking, drinking, gambling and playing online games, etc.. He lived independently when he was in high school, and he didn't get any of those bad habits, he also didn't waste money even if his parents gave him a lot of pocket money at that time, a man of these qualities was rare, it seemed he was a good man to marry, even though I didn't like him very much. I just didn't expect that his temper and abnormal character were like this. I was eager to get married, and he also wanted to get married very much. I am always anxious to outdo others, since others had got married, so should I. So I didn't think too much and made the decision.

The first few days after marriage were sweet, but they didn't last long. He started to show his irritable temper. I didn't pay much attention to that, I thought it was a problem in grinding period. And later, he started to say I was not good. He said "you are short, ugly, your skin is dark and has many pimples." He frequently asked me, "what can you give me? how can you help me?"

Short after our marriage, it was his birthday in January. We planned to have dinner together, but I was kept for the new year gala performance rehearsal by my supervisor, so I told him the dinner might will be cancelled. After the rehearsal, it was about 8pm or 9pm, I proposed eating something together. Then he came and angrily scolded me, "liar! You played me like a fool!" I felt being wronged, what could I do with my supervisor's order? But I also understood his anger, I just thought it was excessive. Why couldn't he understand my situation? His temper was bad, he could get angry with any trivial things. In rainy days, he would pound the driving wheel and pointed a finger to the sky and said, "why even god bully me?" At home, he would kick doors, pound walls, smash bowls, etc. (*Why did he behave like this?*) He has virginity complex. I had a boyfriend two years before I knew him, but he was also not a virgin, he had a girlfriend in the past, and we both told our love histories before marriage. I am a straight person, I thought it was not a big deal that I had a boyfriend in the past, and he accepted that first. But he actually had double-standard and didn't let go of my love history. He started to investigate me, he browsed all my posts, photos in my social network platforms, such as QQ zone, renren.com(a SNS platform for students), Weibo, etc., and tried to find my ex-boyfriend's page on renren.com and browsed all his posts. Finally, he asked me to delete all my posts related with my ex-boyfriend in these platforms, and I agreed even though I felt surprised because I had forgotten those things myself, why did he care so much? But he was not satisfied, he said "the posts in your ex-boyfriend's side are not deleted, you should call him and ask him to delete those posts!" and "are there anything else that you feel sorry for me but didn't tell?" He tortured me in this way at that time.

I had many bags, one day, he found some photos of me and my ex-boyfriend in the inter-layer of a bag and started to blame me. I admit I didn't handle the photos in a correct way, but our marriage was so quick, it is understandable that I couldn't throw everything related with my ex-boyfriend away in a short time. I also had a flash drive which stored some photos of me with my ex-boyfriend, the flash drive wasn't used for a couple of years, but he found it out and stole it away and didn't return it until today. For the photo issues, he accused me of doing things wrong, and said I still loved my ex-boyfriend. I thought I might be wrong, I shouldn't let him see those photos, and he was upset because he cared about me so much, I understood his anger as jealous. But later I found a beautiful box in his room when I visited his parents' home, I was curious and opened it. It was filled with photos, letters, gifts between him and his ex-girlfriend. I got very angry, how did you treat me when I kept my stuffs related with the past? but you still have your own stuffs? It was excessive! He once told me that he had threw all his old stuffs away when my elder cousin(sister) came for mediation. My cousin is close to me, she asked my situation after marriage, I couldn't hide it from her because the unhappiness was on my face. He complained to my cousin that I was a bad woman because I kept those things. We had endless quarrels for various kinds of trivial things, it made me very fretful. We had big quarrels due to these issues, he pounded walls and smashed things. In order to pacify me, he wrote some guarantees and said he would change his bad temper. After discovering his old photos, I put them on the table of his parents' home and stopped answering his phone. I left to stay in a classmate's home in Huzhou, Zhejiang for a couple of days. But I also told my parents and him my whereabouts before I went there. My classmate's mother knew my situation, she asked me to stay for a few more days. She said, you should re-consider about this man. It was about May or June in 2015, the wedding banquet had not been held yet (*wedding banquet means a public wedding, it was held in October, 2015*). But you know what he did? He called police and said I was missing. Police called me and I told them "my husband knew my whereabouts, he called police on purpose, please ignore him." After my return, he blamed me for showing those pictures to his parents and got very angry. He asked me to be transparent to him and tell him the password of my phone. I had nothing to hide, so I gave him the password. But he didn't even allow me to visit his QQ Zone (something like Facebook), I have never seen his page. He was not transparent to me, when we got married, I didn't even know his salary level for a long time. One time, I walked out of bathroom and saw him peeping my phone. I said you behave like a thief, and asked him to go back to his parents' home. (*the two live in a rented flat after marriage*) Another reason of his bad temper was probably due to his job. When we got married, the company he worked was closed and he lost his job. His father scolded him for failing to find a job. He didn't have salary for a few months and he had to depend on me.

He didn't have any friends. Besides his parents, I am the only one he can give vent to. He was brought up by his grandparents in rural area, his parents were doing business in Shanghai. He once told me, he didn't sleep with his grandparents but slept alone in his parents' room and he felt someone would harm him every night. He moved to city after entering junior high school, but lived alone for the most of the time.

I once asked him to sit down and discuss our conflicts calmly and reasonably, but he just said, "you don't even know what your faults are, how could we discuss?" He always blame me for his faults. For example, when we quarreled, he would say, I beat you because you scolded me first, I scolded you because your attitude to me was bad. One time, he called me and said he would not come back for dinner, I said "okay and I will hang the phone". And he became very mad and said "your attitude is so cold to me, I didn't even finish my words and you just hung my phone!" He said I didn't respect him. It felt he lacked love.

Before marriage, I didn't know him very well, but after these things, I gradually started to find what he really was. But even in that circumstances, I didn't think about divorce. Because I am a stubborn person, since I had decided to marry him, I would not consider divorce easily. It was just quarrels about our love histories, if we divorced because of these issues, we would be laughed at by our former lovers.

I don't remember well how many times he had beaten me, too many times. He would slap my face, push me to the ground, push me to the bed and hold my wrist so I couldn't move, strangle my throat, etc. I was dumbstruck when he beat me for the first time. It was in March, 2015, I was surprised, angry and wronged, it was a sudden slap. My parents never beat me since I was born. But I didn't fight back, I kept quarreling with him and smashed my Samsung Galaxy Note 3, a good phone in 2015, that was the first phone I smashed. After that, he wrote his first guarantee and took his mother to apologize. Our quarrels continued, he also took his parents to my parents' home to apologize. My parents told him, you shouldn't beat her, we cherish our baby daughter, it is wrong that you beat her.

But he always denied that he had beaten me. I decided not to marry him(*means not holding a wedding banquet*) in August. The conflict became more serious and I realized we might don't fit each other. But he soon apologized and wrote a guarantee. His mother advised us to live with them so they could watch him, that was September 2015.

After the mediation from parents in both sides and the apologies and guarantee from him, things were pacified for a while, and the wedding banquet was held in that October. His jealousy and other things, I could bear, if he didn't beat me, maybe our marriage still can continue without a big problem.

After moving to his parents' apartment, we had a fierce quarrel again and than he wrote another guarantee. He grabbed my hair and threw me to the ground and beat me. And his parents entered the room, his father started to beat him, and his mother tried to stop his father who then turned around and beat his mother. And his father kicked him out of the home for a few days, saying he is not a good husband who doesn't cherish his good life.

And another time, he beat me again, and I told my elder cousin and another cousin, then they came to investigate.

As they entered the house, my ex-husband started to scold them with very dirty languages. My cousin's husband lost his temper and grab my ex-husband's collar and pushed him against the wall. Then my mother in law went to help his son and started to beat my cousin's husband. The mom loves her son very much, partly because she felt sorry for him, since she didn't take care of him when he was young and returned hometown from Shanghai when her son graduated from university. My cousin and her husband were very angry, they came because my ex-husband beat me, but my ex-husband didn't explain the situation and scolded them instead while I was crying on the side, it was not hard to imagine how their cousin's life was like in this man's home.

Every time after a quarrel, he would apologize, his attitude was very sincere, "I am sorry! I will write a guarantee for you. Dear wife, I was wrong, I would never scold you and beat you any more! I love you so much! I guarantee I will treat you well and I will do all housework." I was convinced and I had to. His performance skills were so good, I thought he should work as an actor.

(*Did you try to find help from outside to resolve your conflicts?*) No, "domestic scandal should not be exposed to outside", how dare I tell these to others? He didn't beat me till I got bruises, otherwise I would have fled, he was smart. He wanted to control me and enjoyed the feeling that I was afraid of him. If I planned to watch a movie, he would stop me and said those who watch movies are fools and watching movie is a waste of money. But if you had bought tickets, he would be happy to go, because he didn't have to pay. He would be very happy for taking advantage of me. I paid movie tickets, restaurant bills, his phone bills, cellphone, computer, even CDs in his car, etc., he said he didn't have Alipay and didn't know how to use online banking(*quite unusual for a young man like him, maybe a lie*), he didn't give me his salary. But I could endure this, I thought it was not a big deal, comparing with bad habits such as smoking, drinking, prostitution and gambling etc.. If only he didn't quarrel with me, he could do anything as long as he liked.

Two weeks after the wedding banquet, my grandmother was in hospital and I had to take care of her. But he strangled my throat at the door and didn't let me go. I managed to go to the hospital and stayed in the hospital for 2 nights. Then his mother and him went to the hospital and gave 500RMB to my grandma as an silent apology, because relative like his mother didn't have to visit my grandma when she was in hospital. In November, 2015, his grandma(mother's mother) passed away. I had to go to his grandma's home after work everyday. And I found I was pregnant. But later I had miscarriage, about 3 or 4 weeks old, I asked doctor why. Doctor said it could be any reason, she was not sure the exact reason. When I told him the miscarriage, he was happy. Because the pregnancy was not in our plan, he said he didn't prepare for that(*such as a change of diet, good rest* etc.), and I didn't take folic acid in advance, so it was not sure if the baby would be healthy, he didn't want it.

In December, we still had quarrels, but he had stopped beating me as often as before, such as slapping. But our quarrels usually continued to early morning, he didn't let me go to sleep. And he liked to force me to have sex with after quarrels, I couldn't accept that, it was very painful. He would also ask me to do some disgusting things for him, indescribable things. I told him I couldn't do that, I really couldn't. And he would get angry. Sex life between a spouse is an ordinary thing, but those things he required should be based on mutual consent, he should not force me to do something that I couldn't accept in my heart. And I also didn't have those skills and experiences, I couldn't accept that. But he would force me, if I didn't agree, he would scold me for a whole night. He would say, "you are such a bitch, who knows if you had done this with your ex-boyfriend in the past! Why do you pretend to be so reserved in my home?" I couldn't tell this kind of things to anyone. Sometimes, I couldn't stand this torture, I scratched my neck with my fingernails, it was all blood. But I felt relieved after seeing blood, I had vented out. Even under this circumstances, I didn't even think about divorce.

Also in December, his mother said his son had a child's temper and he could change if he has his own child. And my parents also persuaded me to give birth to a baby since I was not young(*she didn't tell her parents the former pregnancy*). Then we started to prepare for pregnancy and I was pregnant in January, 2016. On about January 31st, during winter vacation, we had a quarrel again due to some reason I don't remember. I was pregnant, and my mood was not stable. With the psychological pressure from him, I had some depressive disorders and couldn't sleep at night. Only hurting myself could bring me some relief. He kept murmuring by my side, I couldn't stand it. I lied on the bed with my eyes open, and thinking "what are all these for?" Even breathing was a tiring thing, I felt life was meaningless. When we quarreled, I became hysteria, but he didn't give in. Scolding couldn't satisfy him at that time, because I would scold back, I feared nothing, I didn't even fear death, how could I fear him, I don't care. He couldn't control me, scolding didn't work, pushing was useless, because I could stand up and fight back. Then he strangled my throat and held my wrists which were two ways he could control me, because I couldn't move, he held my twists so tight that they turned blue. He asked me to apologize and admit my faults. He strangled my throat so heavy that I almost died, I couldn't breathe and my mind became a blank. When he let go, I had a big gasp. I don't know if that was the taste of death. That was the moment I started to worry as a mother, considering his temper, I didn't know if he would change, I was not sure if the birth of a baby was good or bad, having a baby was like a burden rather than happiness to me. Later he apologized again, he guaranteed he would change his temper and behavior. I clearly understood at that time that we didn't fit each other, but I chose to believe him, because I was pregnant and had no options. Gradually I had sleep problem, I went to see a doctor in Hangzhou in middle February, 2016. I told the doctor my

sleep problem and started to cry. During those days, I couldn't speak as calmly as I do now, I cried with tears covered my face. The doctor told me it wasn't my fault and advised me taking my ex-husband to come and see him. But I thought it was impossible that he would come with me, we quarreled so much and if I asked him to see a doctor, it would just give him a new excuse to scold me, and the doctor agreed that those problematic people won't admit they have problems. The doctor said a man's temper is hard to change and advised me not to get pregnant until I was 100% sure. But I was pregnant already. In order to reconcile us, my aunt invited us a dinner during my second pregnancy. We asked him to have some rice wine and I drove him home and told him I could drive him to pick up his car next morning. Then in the early morning next day, he woke me up and asked me to drive him to pick up his car. I said I didn't feel good and suggested him to take a taxi which would cost less than 10RMB, but he insisted that I drove him there. Then we had a quarrel for such a small thing. I had strong morning sickness, and I didn't feel good in those days, then I asked for a leave to my supervisor. I went to stay in my hometown, a few days later, there was some blood, I lost my second baby, about two months old. But he didn't believe me, I had to take him to see a doctor. He asked the doctor with a bad attitude, the doctor criticized him for not consoling me but doubting the reason of miscarriage. He kept thinking that I arranged the miscarriage on purpose, he said I deliberately ate longan and crabs in my aunt's dinner (*Chinese superstitions say these food can cause miscarriage*). But I ate those things because I had good appetite that day, I usually didn't have good appetite during pregnancy. He even went to my parents' home and accused me for the miscarriage. He said I shouldn't keep those pictures of my ex-boyfriend once again. My parents used to ask us to reconcile and persuade me to have a baby, after this incident, they agreed my plan to divorce. In September, 2015, I moved out from his parents' apartment and told him we needed some time to calm down. Because I couldn't sleep at night and walked as if I could fall down at any time, a psychologist suggested me to have a depressive disorder test after the miscarriage. The results were bad. I was asked to get treatment in hospital, but I refused, because I couldn't afford the treatment and I had to go back to work. The doctor prescribed some medicines for me instead and asked me to sign a waiver. After moving out from his parents' department, his parents came with him to apologize several times and persuaded us to continue our life together. In the past, they apologized, and I accepted. But the same old routine didn't work any more. I told her it was impossible and I hid away from her every time they came. Then his mother came again and said since the marriage couldn't be repaired, then we had to discuss about economic issues. She said we should give them 200 000RMB for their loss, including bride price and the wedding banquets in their side which was about 100 000RMB and also paid by them (*The bride price was given to me in June or July, 2015. It was 118 000RMB, including*

*golden jewelries and banquet in my home. And I had taken back 50 000RMB to the new family).* But these money had been spent out during our marriage together, and I have those online consumption records. My mother said we couldn't give you 200 000RMB, and offered 50 000RMB, even though I had suffered a lot. But his mother said divorce harmed his son more than me, she said it would be easy to find a husband as a divorced woman, but hard to find a wife as a divorced man. "If you divorce my son, he won't be able to stand it, he will come and kill your whole family or commit suicide in your home," his mother threatened. My mother was so scared that he became sick and stayed in hospital for a week.

In late April, 2016, I filed the divorce lawsuit in local court. The case was called in court on May 4th, we both hired a lawyer, but it was useless in conciliation. I submitted the evidences of domestic violence to the court, but the judge didn't admit them as domestic violence. My ex-husband's mother asked for a lot of money from us in court, 160 000RMB or 200 000RMB, the first judge told her it was impossible. Then she started to harass me in my office, trying to get a big offer from my side. She went to harass me in my office for eight times in June, "you either go home with me, or give me back the money," she said. Police couldn't help because she just came to talk and didn't do anything else. I was the joke in my colleagues' eyes during those days. Police suggested me to record her visits and when the times came to a limit, they could register it as a case. Then the mother told my ex-husband my shootings of her visits, my ex-husband came to my office and scolded me, and video-taped me with his phone. Then we had a physical conflict when tried to grab each other's phones, we called police and were detained for a night. It was my first time detained in a police station. I asked for help from Women's Federation after being harassed by his mother. The lady in there was very nice, she helped me obtain my safety protection order by talking with the second judge. Women's Federation asked neighborhood committee to persuade his mother, but she didn't listen. And the committee told me not to call Women's Federation or them anymore, because they don't have enforcement power, their persuasion was useless.

After moving from my ex-husband's apartment, I lived with a relative. But he found the relative one day and blamed her for damaging our marriage. I had to move again and lived in other places to hide away from him. He sent me pictures of neighborhood and messages to threat to kill me or kill himself, I was very scared and called my exhusband's lawyer. He said, "my client's temper is dangerous, maybe you should apply for a safety protection order."

It is a small city, the lawyer gave me this tip and didn't lose anything, he might expect me to remember his favor and introduced other cases to him in the future. I thought safety protection order was a good idea, but it was not easy to get one. The first judge stalled my application and the case was closed after the verdict, then I had to find another judge to apply for the order. When the order was issued with 4-month term, my ex-husband found the judge and

wrangled with her, he said the order made him lose his face. The judge was worried, and asked me to keep the order to myself and don't show it to anyone, but according to law, the order should be copied to my school, local police station and neighborhood committee. When I apply to extend the order when it was expired after four months, she asked me not to make trouble because my ex-husband complained to her for the issuance of the order, so she refused the extension.

Six months later after the verdict, I filed the second divorce proceedings after my first one was rejected. I didn't hire a lawyer this time, a lawyer cost 3000RMB per case, I couldn't afford this. And cheap lawyers are useless, good ones are more expensive. My salary is low, now I rent an apartment and have a small second-hand car, for the loss of my second baby, I arranged a rite in a temple and that costed me 2800RMB, I have to depend on my parents to make ends meet every month. I will move to school dormitory to save month in next week, it costs 160RMB per month, much cheaper than outside.

I didn't collect many evidences of my ex-husband's domestic violence to me, because I didn't think about divorce for a long time. He wrote several guarantees after we had big fights, and I did tape something he said to me after I was beaten by him to prove my suffering to my parents, I hoped they could understand my situation. I also kept the chat history on Wechat between us. I consulted with about 20 lawyers, all of them said what I suffered was domestic violence and the requirement of the return of bride price was wrong (*the current judge said I should return some bride price, as for the amount, he just said he has discretionary power*). His mother once said, "he did beat you, but you are neither died, nor paralyzed, why do you make so many troubles?" She didn't realize it is a great harm psychologically. People may recognize the domestic violence and really care if I get a serious depressive disorder and I committed suicide, or when my ex-husband strangled me to death. The judges asked me if I had "record of calling police", "proof of injury", but if I had these things, can you imagine to what level I had been beaten? I didn't intend to divorce, how could I collect evidence before that? The current judge asked me to console my husband's feelings, but who has consoled me? The judge also criticized me for being not prudent in marriage, but I asked them, "didn't I want to manage this marriage well?" But they didn't try to understand my situation and sympathize me. A judge once told me, "don't think you are miserable, I have seen more worse examples. Your case is not that long, some couple couldn't even finish their divorce proceedings after four years." The main arguments in my case are the return and usage of the bride price, it seems the judge didn't realize this is a divorce case caused by domestic violence.

Now I don't have a lawyer, and judges usually set up language traps for me, but I decided to appeal to the higher court in Hangzhou if the verdict this time doesn't give me justice. My parents support me to refuse reconciliation, because I have evidences of domestic violence, those guarantees, tape recordings, chat history on Wechat, etc to

prove that I was harmed more than once by him. Even though the judge said my evidences are not sufficient, but my ex-husband has no evidences but his words. Reconciliation means we were both wrong and the price would be at least 50 000RMB at least but a court verdict may will order a smaller amount, because I offered that price in last year, but they didn't accept it and kept demanding for a much higher amount. Now, I refused the reconciliation, because I don't want to give them 50 000RMB and I can't accept this: I was beaten and I have to pay him for divorce, this is not justice. I could actually even require compensation for the domestic violence according to law. If I accept a reconciliation, my ex-husband and his family could keep harassing me, but they won't do that if it is a court verdict.

I hope this case will be closed soon, but I also want a just verdict very much. If they accepted my offer in last July, then it was finished. But it has lasted until now, if I pay them a lot of money to end this, how will I convince myself the meaning of life in future? I was beaten, I lost two babies, and I have to pay them for divorce, it is too crucial to accept.

The role the anti-domestic violence law played in my case is the issuance of safety protection order, but nothing more. The order was good and very useful. My school had a good reason to stop my husband from harassing me and I felt safe, it was a good protection.

--

Regards  
Chaoqun  
Mobile: 1851XXXXXXXX  
NRC Handelsblad Shanghai Bureau

## Bijlage 8:

**Van:** Charles Zhang [mailto:[chaoqunchung@XXXXXXX](mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXXXX)]

**Verzonden:** maandag 18 september 2017 14:08

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXXXX)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXXXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXXXXX)>

**Onderwerp:** Problems in the Domestic Violence report

Xiaoping was bijna gewurgd voordat ze kon scheiden

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/07/12/xiaoping-was-bijna-gewurgd-voordat-ze-kon-scheiden-11330288-a1566344>

I prepared and did the interview by myself alone in Lin'an, Zhejiang as Mr. Oscar Garschagen was busy writing reports about N. Korea trip. If Mr. Garschagen doesn't admit that, please ask him to submit his tickets and other evidences. I am the only one who contacted with the victim in this report.

1. Finally, Lin Xiaoping is from the man she should never have married.

Problem: Lin Xiaoping(in transcript I used Lin Xiaojing) is a pseudonym, I clearly marked that in the transcript. The reason Mr. Garschagen chose not to mention this in the report is probably because he said in the report that "but by a new law against domestic violence more women dare to open their mouths."

2. "But you must be almost killed or strangled, you want to be heard by the police and the judges, including this new law," is the experience of 30-year-old accountant in Linan, a town in Zhejiang province.

Problem: The victim was born in 1989(see transcript), she is 28 years old this year, not 30.

3. Lin Xiaoping acknowledges that. "I only dared to get to the police after my second miscarriage," she says.

Problem: The victim didn't say this in the interview(see transcript).

4. Websites of women's organizations have also started publishing photographs of victims and perpetrators.

Problem: I didn't find this kind of mechanism, Mr. Garschagen once asked me to find some pictures of domestic violence victims, I found a few, but I didn't tell him the existence of this mechanism.

5. In accordance with the law, the police sent her husband a written warning to behave better. A warning that he could easily ignore, because there is only a small fine.

Problem: The written warning is not related with fine.(see attached Personal Protection Order pictures)

6. But the document, an official confirmation that she was a victim of domestic violence, was useful, because she could go to court to initiate a divorce procedure.

Problem: The court did issue a personal protection order for the victim, but didn't recognize her as a domestic violence victim.(see attached Personal Protection Order pictures)

7. The first judge, a man, quit her request: "It may be true that he hit you a couple of times, but that can not convince you. You are not dead, seriously injured or paralyzed. Try again. Save your marriage! "

Problem: The judge didn't say this. The victim's mother in law said something similar: "His mother once said, 'he did beat you, but you are neither died, nor paralyzed, why do you make so many troubles?'"(see transcript)

8. Only a second judge, a woman, convincingly proved that she was the victim of domestic violence and gave permission for a divorce.

Problem: The judge didn't permit the divorce, if a divorce is permitted by a judge, then there is no need for conciliation.

9. Lin Xiaoping has meanwhile moved to another city and is likely to work at Alibaba, the major internet trading house.

Problem: There was nothing about Alibaba mentioned in the interview(see transcript).

10. "She demands 20,000 euros. My mother is doing the negotiations and has offered 5,000 euros. I'm afraid I have to pay. This is how China is going, "says Xiaoping.

Problem: The victim didn't say that in the interview(see transcript).

11. A couple of days after the interview with NRC she appeals that the negotiations have been completed and that she and her family will pay 9,000 euros to the family of her violent ex.

Illustrated with sad emoticons: "Yes, I also think it's a lot of money if you think I'm the victim and not him. But I want to start a new life. I want to get married again and get children if I can manage it as a divorced woman. "

Problem: The verdict was not announced even in early September(see chat history picture), and the victim didn't say this in the interview also.

--

Regards

Chaoqun

Mobile: 1851XXXXXXX

**Bijlage 9:**

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXXXX>]

**Verzonden:** maandag 18 september 2017 16:00

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXX)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXXX)>

**Onderwerp:** 7. Problems in Wanda Studios report

Kritiek op de duurste Chinese film ooit is niet welkom

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/02/01/filmgebouw-china-vol-met-lege-zalen-6501767-a1543936>



[Kritiek op de duurste Chinese film ooit is niet welkom - NRC](#)  
[www.nrc.nl](http://www.nrc.nl)

Chinese film: Kritiek op 'The Great Wall' geldt bijna als landverraad, maar de ambitie van de Chinese film vertaalt zich nog niet in kwaliteit.

1. "May we not say much about politics, there is apparently a new rule that we need to find all the movies," says Zhang Ying, editor at Douban Film site , with a loud smile.

Problem: I didn't help Mr. Garschagen find this contact Zhang Ying from Douban film, I am just suspicious about the existence of this interview, you can ask him to provide contact information of this person and interview notes, etc..

2. When a Wanda studio guide sends her golf cart to an artificial island with cinema complex and 7-star hotel, she exclaims: "We hope that foreign stars, as well as writers and costume designers, will feel at home." If the seawind 's air pollution Beijing blows away, sure.

Problem: it was difficult to get permission to arrange an interview in the studios at first, finally we got approval, but Mr. Garschagen cancelled the trip later on. If he claimed he visited the place, please asked him to provide the contact information, train or air tickets, original pictures(you can check EXIF information of the picture about what camera and what date, etc.) of the place he took in there, interview notes, etc..

--

Regards  
Chaoqun

**Bijlage 10:**

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXX>]

**Verzonden:** maandag 18 september 2017 16:08

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXXX)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXXX)>

**Onderwerp:** 8. Problems in Spring Festival Gala report

Dit programma trekt komende zondag 700 miljoen kijkers

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2016/02/05/heel-china-blijft-thuis-voor-lenteavond-1588290-a41949>

1. And above all: Spring evening should radiate "positive energy". "When you look, you will understand China, the people and the party, at least that is the intention of the makers," says journalist / writer Du Erhu, who has published about the gala since the 1990s.

Problem: The spelling of Mr. Du is Du Enhu, not Du Erhu. And Mr. Du didn't say this quote in the interview(see the transcript). I contacted with Mr. Du and made the telephonic interview by myself alone.

2. Creating war, occupation and liberation in opera, and CCTV's sketches, says Du. "To be chosen for the stories of ordinary soldiers and ordinary people, that's the calibrated method." You would expect the party leaders to take the opportunity to have a kind of new year's speech, but strikingly enough they are missing in the programming. "This is contrary to the basic concept that the show is about ordinary people," says Du.

Problem: Mr. Du didn't say this quote in the interview(see the transcript).

--

Regards

Chaoqun

**Bijlage 11:**

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXX>]

**Verzonden:** maandag 18 september 2017 16:47

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXI](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXI)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXX)>

**Onderwerp:** 9. Problems in the Great Wall Protection report

Van de Chinese Muur wil iedereen een stukje

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2016/04/29/vallende-stenen-1613569-a520398>

1. "Barbarians, thieves", Qiao Guohua (69) sniffs as he glances in the scrub. A broken point of a chisel, he knows immediately, left behind by antique thieves. Problem: Mr. Qiao Guohua was 60 years old in 2016(see the link below), not 69. Mr. Garschagen seldom asked the age of interviewees and just estimated their ages instead. In this report, all three interviewees' ages were wrong, but because they were also reported by lots of other media, it is easy to verify their real ages.

[http://news.ifeng.com/a/20151009/44799225\\_0.shtml](http://news.ifeng.com/a/20151009/44799225_0.shtml) 抚宁县界岭口村的长城保护员乔国华今年59岁·负责镇上8公里长城。

Mr. Qiao Guohua's cellphone number: 159XXXXXXXX

2. Back in Jielingkou, Qiao's boss, Dong Yaohui (68), Vice President of the Chinese Long Wall Association, is waiting for us.

Problem: Mr. Dong Yaohui was born in 1957, he was 59 years old in 2016.

<https://baike.baidu.com/item/董耀会>

3. An exception is businessman and former coal mining boss Xu Guohua (69) in the village of Banchangyu, just west of Qinhuangdao.

Problem: Mr. Xu Guohua was born in 1954, he was 62 in 2016, not 69.

<http://share.iclient.ifeng.com/news/shareNews?aid=102019279&vt=5>

1980年，26岁的许国华在村里入股开煤窑·当时村里没有通电·全靠人力用绞盘从井口拉煤。

Mr. Xu's cellphone number: 137XXXXXXXX

4. "In ancient times it was common for those who had become rich to invest a part of their fortune in their hometowns. I'll do that now too, "says Xu, who started as a traveling grower with horse-drawn carriage, and later operated eight coal mines.

Problem: Mr. Xu said he once worked as horse carriage driver, but didn't say it was related with vegetable business. And in the information provided by Mr. Xu, he had 7 coal mines in the past, not 8.

<http://share.iclient.ifeng.com/news/shareNews?aid=102019279&vt=5>

许国华的四十年·这个曾拥有七座煤矿的煤老板的人生际遇·深受大时代影响·却又充满浓重的个人色彩。

5. Xu became known nationally, because historians of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences think that he is indeed a descendant in the 23rd generation of a soldier / construction worker from the Ming Dynasty. Many villagers near the wall

claim to be descendants of construction-savage soldiers, but few can prove that too, Xu. At least, he has a probable story according to genealogists and DNA experts. Problem: Chinese Academy of Social Sciences didn't participate in the verification of Mr. Xu's identity as the descendant of an ancient soldier. But experts from Chinese Academy of Sciences did participate in the verification of some animal fossils found in the Great Wall tourism spot established by Mr. Xu Guohua. And Mr. Xu Guohua is the 25th generation descendant of a Ming dynasty soldier Xu Dacheng, not 23rd generation.

<http://news.qq.com/a/20080831/000936.htm> 日前，中科院专家在秦皇岛市抚宁县板厂峪景区再次发掘出了6个斑鬣狗头骨化石和一具骨架化石，至此，该景区内发现的斑鬣狗化石已有58个，规模居亚洲第一。

[http://blog.sina.com.cn/s/blog\\_5e317b050102uwto.html](http://blog.sina.com.cn/s/blog_5e317b050102uwto.html) 两人手握着手，一起进入“两地长城情·许氏家族第二十五代玄孙祭祖接谱仪式”现场。

[http://blog.sina.com.cn/s/blog\\_5e317b050102uwtc.html](http://blog.sina.com.cn/s/blog_5e317b050102uwtc.html) 两面印有“许”字的旗帜汇合后进入“两地长城情·许氏家族第二十五代玄孙祭祖接谱仪式”会场。

--

Regards  
Chaoqun

## Bijlage 12:

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXX>]

**Verzonden:** maandag 18 september 2017 14:46

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXI](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXI)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXI](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXI)>

**Onderwerp:** 3. Problems in Shanghai Disney Resort report

Mi Lao Shu oftewel Mickey Mouse verovert Shanghai

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2016/06/16/mi-lao-shu-verovert-shanghai-2766441-a1505530>

1. Wednesday evening, tropical thunderstorms also prevented the festive fireworks show, Ignite the Dream, and also the official opening ceremony with video message from President Xi Jinping and Barack Obama on Thursday.

Problem: President Xi Jinping sent a congratulation letter for the opening of Shanghai Disney Resort, rather than a congratulation video(see the link below).

<http://biz.zjol.com.cn/system/2016/06/17/021192290.shtml>

2. However, Disney has managed to keep the military-looking, heavily armed Chinese police out of the gate. "That display of dark military uniforms does not fit in the family, innocent atmosphere we want to create," said Murray King of Shanghai Disney.

Problem: I have confirmed with Mr. Murray King from Shanghai Disney Resort, he doesn't remember he had seen Mr. Garschagen.talked with him or invited him to attend the opening ceremony, and he is now trying to prepare an official statement for this issue. You can also contact with him to verify his quote in this report, his contact information is: [MXXX@XXXXXX](mailto:MXXX@XXXXXX)

--

Regards  
Chaoqun

**Bijlage 13:**

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXX>]

**Verzonden:** maandag 18 september 2017 14:56

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXXX)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXXX)>

**Onderwerp:** 4. Problems in Beidou Navigation System Installation report

Chinese terreurbestrijding\_ verplichte gps in voertuigen

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/02/21/chinese-terreurbestrijding-verplichte-gps-in-voertuigen-6852861-a1547002>

1. All vehicles , including tractors, bulldozers and cranes, in China's Xinjiang Province, must be equipped with GPS systems connected to the national Beidou satellite navigation system. The measure is promulgated in the Mongolian prefecture Bayingolin, adjacent to the Central Asian neighborhood of China, and will be extended to the Islamic prefectures.

Problem: The policy is only implemented in Bayingolin, Xinjiang, not in whole Xinjiang area, and there is also not a plan of this kind, so far(see the link below).

<http://www.globaltimes.cn/content/1033881.shtml>

2. In addition, they do not have to pay the Beidou-gps systems themselves, but the cost of internet connections.

Problem: Some users have to pay the cost of Beidou navigation system hardware, some don't(see attached information I gathered for Mr. Garschagen)

3. Since the major clashes between a Turkish dialect-speaking Uighurs and Han-Chinese in 2009 and a series of attacks in 2013 and 2014 in major cities outside Xinjiang, the authorities sent 50,000 military and police officers to the province.

10,000 paramilitary police officers held in Urumqi and Kashgar manifestations.

Problem: I couldn't find the sources of these information( the authorities sent 50,000 military and police officers to the province. 10,000 paramilitary police officers held in Urumqi and Kashgar manifestations), please ask Mr. Garschagen to supply the sources.

--

Regards  
Chaoqun

**Bijlage 14:**

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXX>]

**Verzonden:** maandag 18 september 2017 17:14

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXX)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXX)>

**Onderwerp:** 11. Problems in Military Reform report

China heeft slimmeriken nodig voor militaire ambities

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2016/11/22/slimmerik-met-bril-en-buik-in-moderne-chinese-leger-5403828-a1532997>

1. Mao Yiwu is an alumni of Jiaotong University in Shanghai, a breeding pond of hackers. Recently, he would have been rejected because of the thickness of his glasses and his belly.

About the myth of a warrior who fights with a blinking spear on a harnessed horse in the video, he raises his shoulders. He laughs shyly: "I know everything about computers."

An excited officer calls Mao not to speak to a foreign journalist. A few days later, he announced via WeChat that native country love "naturally" plays a role in his thinking, but his financial situation gave the break.

"It is becoming increasingly difficult to find a good job quickly and there are many benefits to the army," he writes. He was more likely to get started at Alibaba, Baidu (China Google) or the IT companies Huawei and Xiaomi. But there he has to compete with hundreds of thousands of people who just come from the university. Problem: I didn't participate this interview, and I am very suspicious about the existence of this interview because it is very difficult to interview a PLA soldier no matter it is by a domestic media or foreign media. It could be an easy job to verify the existence of the interviewee by contacting with the conscription office or Shanghai Jiaotong University about the soldiers or students lists in 2016, if you send an investigator to China. Since Mr. Garschagen said he had the interviewee's Wechat information, you can ask him to provide the person's contact information, Wechat information and interview notes, etc..

2. Dozens of officers with the rank of General Major and above have been falsely fired. Almost all of them are sentenced to life imprisonment for violations of party discipline. Since 2014, fifteen officers have committed suicide because they had "sold" or tortured promotions with arms purchases.

Problem: "Almost all of them are sentenced to life imprisonment for violations of party discipline", the description is not true, I don't find the verdicts of these military "tigers" as Mr. Garschagen described, please ask Mr. Garschagen to provide the source of this information.

<http://military.people.com.cn/n/2015/0303/c1011-26628938.html> <http://news.163.com/17/0628/07/CO0K4RBH0001899N.html> These reports didn't mention the situation as Mr. Garschagen described.

And the description of 15 military officers' suicidal since 2014 is also very suspicious, I couldn't find the source of this information, please ask Mr. Garschagen to provide it.

--

Regards  
Chaoqun

## Bijlage 15:

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXX>]

**Verzonden:** maandag 18 september 2017 17:28

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXX)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXX)>

**Onderwerp:** 12. Problems in Leukemia Children report

Oma Ten is arm want Wutao (12) heeft kanker

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/02/01/filmgebouw-china-vol-met-lege-zalen-6501767-a1543936>

The interview was a short one in Doctor Wang Ningling's office in Hefei, Anhui. We went to the hospital, had a walk in the hospital but didn't do interviews, talked to the doctor and left there.

1. "Nowadays everyone starts treatment. But if it takes too long and serious infections occur, the doubt raises. Savings on money, family and friends do not want to borrow anymore. Families of patients then lose confidence in further treatments and in themselves. "

Problem: Doctor Wang Ningling didn't say "savings on money, family and friends do not want to borrow anymore. Families of patients then lose confidence in further treatments and in themselves", these were actually from another interviewee we met on June 1st, 2016(see the transcript) in another place in Hefei.

2. "Because families stopped fighting. Behind every child here is a family trapped in a financial tragedy. "

Problem: "Behind every child here is a family trapped in a financial tragedy" was actually my summary after seeing those poor children on June 1st, 2016, Doctor Wang didn't say that(see the transcript).

3. To save children, doctor Wang spends a lot of time on the families. "I try to convince them to continue. Give me another day, please, or one week, and you'll see that treatment helps. But many do not want anymore. "

Problem: Doctor Wang didn't say "but many do not want anymore", she said most families adhere to treatment(see the transcript).

4. The two teens are sponsored by two local companies who are personally approached by Doctor Wang. "Their parents had already given up the fight, but they definitely decided to rescue them," says the stately woman full of conviction.

Problem: We didn't meet these two teens who were sponsored by two local companies.

5. She points to Zhang Ligiao (28), a young woman who tries to calm her 3-year-old Youyou, just put on an infusion. Her husband works temporarily in the kitchen of the colossal hospital. Both have given up their work in Shanghai to take care of the toddler.

Would it? In a week, you and Youyou will go back to their room in wet, hot and damp Wujianong with its muddy steps and open sewers. Infections are inevitable and very expensive - the drugs are not covered by the insurance.

"I do not dare to confront my family anymore, we have already borrowed a lot of money from them," says Zhang Ligiao. She has established her hope for a still unknown donor.

Problem: We didn't interview this Zhang Ligiao family(by the way, there is not a giao spelling in Chinese). Please ask Mr. Garschagen to provide the contact information of this family and interview notes.

6. As open as she talks about her work, Wang is so closed about the deeper causes of the cancer wave in China. "I can not talk about that from the hospital administration. Sorry, "she whispers.

Problem: Doctor Wang Ningling didn't say this in the interview(see the transcript).

Doctor Wang Ningling's cellphone number: 13XXXXXXXX, and  
email: [zwnltt@XXXXXX](mailto:zwnltt@XXXXXX)

--

Regards  
Chaoqun

## Bijlage 16:

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXX>]

**Verzonden:** maandag 18 september 2017 18:10

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXX)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXX)>

**Onderwerp:** 14. Problems in Yangchun Village report

Het gevecht om de mummie in lotushouding

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/07/13/het-gevecht-om-de-mummie-in-lotushouding-12017539-a1566602>

I've found about 20 problems in this report, but most of them have to be verified in the village, here below I just list 5 of them, some of them can be verified by public information.

1. "And we wept with great joy when we heard that our patriarch in 2014 was discovered and it is owned by the Dutch collector Oscar Overeem" adds his cousin Lin Jiabing (63) on. "A miracle." The discovery of the image was in 2014 world news because it was found that under the gold-plated and varnished patchwork was a mummy in lotus position.

Lin Ligui states that no other village , the mummy has claimed, while the news of the discovery in 2014 of the mummy in the picture was big news in China. But more importantly, he says is "that the names and characters in the image correspond to itimage that has always been here ". He shows pictures, but they do not blink in brightness.

Problem: the time when villagers found the mummy Buddha was the morning of March 16th, 2015, not 2014. The first villager who discovered the Buddha's re-appearance was Lin Yongtuan(林永团)(see the link below).

<http://news.qq.com/a/20151211/050324.htm> 林乐妙：今年3月份，最早是村民林永团在网上看到了匈牙利博物馆展出了一尊和“章公祖师”佛像很相似的文物，便马上向村民告知，消息一下子在我们村子传开了。村里很多人对“章公祖师”像身上痕迹的位置都了如指掌。因为太熟悉了，所以一看国外展览的坐佛照片就知道肯定是我们。

2. Surrounded by curious retirees and children, Lin Ligui, chairman of the village committee, said that Van Overeem is very grateful that he has found "patriarch" Zhanggong. In the place where he lived since the eleventh century, the Puzhao village stamp is now a wooden copy, but that does not mean that Zhanggong's spirit has ever left the village.

Problem: The village head in Yangchun is Lin Kaian(林开安)(see the link 1 below), the village secretary of the party in the village is Lin Kaiwang(林开望)(see the link 2 below). If the "village committee" mentioned in Mr. Garschagen means the conservation association in the village, than it is leader is Lin Yongtuan(林永团)(see the link 3 below), Lin Ligui doesn't fit any of these positions.

从各种新闻中查询可知，阳春村的主任是林开安，村支书是林开望。而如果这个comittee说的是阳春村普照堂文物保护协会的话，会长则是林永团。但不管是哪个职位，都不是Lin Ligui。

[http://paper.people.com.cn/rmrhbhw/html/2015-12/18/content\\_1641556.htm](http://paper.people.com.cn/rmrhbhw/html/2015-12/18/content_1641556.htm) 为“失踪”的章公祖师肉身像操办了第20个祭祀后，福建省三明市大田县阳春村村主任林开安拿到了三明市中级人民法院关于追索章公祖师肉身像起诉荷兰藏家的受理通知书。

<http://news.china.com/domesticgd/10000159/20150323/19412311.html> 阳春村村支书林开望说·村里的老人都说这尊佛像是真人真身坐化的·而且佛像被盗时·坐垫也被一起盗走。

<http://www.hxfzzx.com/2017/0630/74200.html> 大田县阳春普照堂文物保护协会 法定代表人：林永团

3. The teasers Lin Chuanzong and Lin Jiabing gladly show the cave where they were hidden as teenagers during the Cultural Revolution (1966-1976) Zhanggong for the young Red Guardians.

Problem: we didn't visit the cave where the Buddha was hidden during the "Cultural Revolution", we just visited villager Lin Shuxing's(林书星) old house in a mountain and saw the attic where Buddha was hidden for years, you can verify with villager Lin Wenqing(林文青) who accompanied us during the whole interview and took pictures along the way. If he remembered a cave visit was arranged, just in case his memory is hazy since so many media visited the village in the past 2 years, please asked him to provide a picture of our visit inside the cave.

Lin Wenqing's phone number: 059XXXXXXXXX(connected with his cellphone also).

4. Like everybody, after the end of the Cultural Revolution , he thought that the danger was over.

Problem: Villagers in there told us they still worried the safety of the Buddha after the end of "cultural revolution", they also told other media that(see the link below).

<http://www.lifeweek.com.cn/2015/0403/45922.shtml> “对章公祖师的安危·林氏家族特别慎重。林乐妙告诉记者·“文革”结束好几年了·章公祖师都还藏在东埔村。上世纪80年代初，阳春小学的校长徐有伍找人修补被“破四旧”工作队敲破的洞·都还是挑了个黄昏时间·不敢声张。

5. "We did not know anything about it in 1995, we had barely good communication. There was only begun the construction of a paved road, "said Lin Ligui.

Problem: When the Buddha was stolen, there was already a paved dirt road in the village, it was there long before the theft. I've confirmed with Mr. Lin Wenqing via Wechat about this fact(please see attached screenshot of our chat history).

--

Regards  
Chaoqun

## Bijlage 17:

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXX>]

**Verzonden:** maandag 18 september 2017 18:55

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXX)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXX)>

**Onderwerp:** 16. Problems in Underground Church report

Steeds meer Chinezen willen liever Jezus dan Mao

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/04/13/steeds-meer-chinezen-willen-liever-jezus-dan-mao-8207499-a1554445>

We visited the church on April 2nd after the introduction of Mr. Ran Yunfei. We said hi to pastor Wang Yi after his sermon in the church, he was busy with other things, than we agreed to have a telephonic interview later. Finally, the interview was made on April 10th.

1. "If we stay and do not evangelize in the parks, we will be tolerated. Even more and we have more than 1,000,000 (or 1000) members. I do not want to grow bigger because that's too much, we split into churches with two-200, three hundred 300 members," he says.

Problem: Mr. Wang didn't say this in the interview. The quantity of members in the church was 850(please see transcript).

2. "Once China has the largest Christian education system in the world," he predicts.

Problem: Mr. Wang didn't say this in the interview(please see transcript).

3. "If we are prosecuted we will be prosecuted. We will not resist. If it is God's will, we will be arrested than they do. It does not make sense to meet underground. If we are afraid, we may be better off with each other in all openness and in God's light," said Wang, currently one of the most important protestant pioneers in China.

Problem: Mr. Wang didn't say "it does not make sense to meet underground. If we are afraid, we may be better off with each other in all openness and in God's light" in the interview(please see transcript).

4. Tears run over the round cheeks of my neighbor Yin Pei (32), a lecturer at one of the universities. Her husband Li Hui (35), an engineer, raises her paper handkerchiefs.

Problem: we didn't ask the ages of these two interviewees, this information was not in my email to Mr. Garschagen(please see attached information of this Christian family).

We had a short meeting with the family after pastor Wang Yi's sermon, after a self-introduction, we just asked the couple why did they join the church and talked about family planning policy. We didn't record the interview with tape recorder or take interviews notes.

5. "We are not robots that only work and make things. We are people, we still have one another, we need love and we find ourselves in God and not in the ideology of the Communist Party, "she tells of her motives.

Problem: The lady didn't say that in the interview. Please ask Mr. Garschagen to provide his interview notes, if there are.

6. On the question of why he goes to church, her husband Li Hui grins: "Otherwise, she did not want to marry me." He even gave up the membership of the Communist Party. "I was a member of my father because it was good for my university entrance and later to get a job. For many party members, that's why they're a member, "he wants to lose.

Problem: The gentleman explained the reason he joined the church was because his wife is a believer of Jesus Christ. We also didn't ask his political identity in the interview.

7. Eight members have even made their switch publicly during a service.

Problem: What Mr. Wang said in the interview was "there were 6 to 7 members of church announced their withdrawal from CPC in public,"(please see transcript) not eight members.

8. "Society has become a source of concern. Family ties, ties in villages, neighborhoods and working communities have become quite loose. There is a restoration of religion throughout China, not only Christianity grows. There is a great need in this 'human-eating-human society' of new community sense, a community that does not offer detestable communism. The party is a cold, efficient and often corrupt organization, not a warm place for all, "argues Wang, a fierce critic of the state.

Problem: Mr. Wang didn't say "there is a great need in this 'human-eating-human society' of new community sense, a community that does not offer detestable communism. The party is a cold, efficient and often corrupt organization, not a warm place for all"(please see transcript).

9. He even sees similarities between the destruction of the Holy Roman empire and the Chinese one-party state which, according to him, is in decline.

Problem: Mr. Wang didn't make this kind of description in the interview(please see transcript).

10. "We do not have a political purpose as a church, but support those who are oppressed by the state - and there are so many in Chengdu," said Wang.

Problem: Mr. Wang didn't say "but support those who are oppressed by the state - and there are so many in Chengdu"(please see transcript).

11. Chen, an artist, had visited the grave of a friend who was ground in the night of 3 to 4 June 1989 by the tanks that were suppressing the great Tiananmen demonstrations.

Problem: Where did Mr. Garschagen learn the vivid details of "who was ground...by the tanks"? Please ask him to provide the source.

12. "We are now taking care of his wife, daughter and his parents who are in trouble as a result of his conviction," said the minister.

Problem: Mr. Wang didn't talk about the Chen Yunfei case in the interview(please see transcript). But we did talk about this case with Mr. Ran Yunfei who is a Christian, a friend of Mr. Wang and Chen Yunfei on April 1st(please see the transcript of interview with Mr. Ran), and Mr. Garschagen made this up into the interview with Mr. Wang.

13. "And that's always a deep moving moment", so he describes his return to "the city on the hill," as he calls his church.

Problem: Mr. Wang didn't say this in the interview(please see transcript). Mr. Garschagen probably borrowed the description from this report: [https://world.wng.org/2016/04/house\\_church\\_on\\_a\\_hill](https://world.wng.org/2016/04/house_church_on_a_hill) (please see attached document about other media's coverage of this church and pastor)

--

Regards  
Chaoqun

**Bijlage 18:**

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXX>]

**Verzonden:** maandag 18 september 2017 23:12

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXXX)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXXX)>

**Onderwerp:** 15. Problems in Cultural Revolution report

Mao heeft ons misleid

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/02/01/filmgebouw-china-vol-met-lege-zalen-6501767-a1543936>

There are many quotes and fact fabrication in this report, I just compared the transcript and report about two interviewees and confirmed with them, one of them made a response in written(see attached email in PDF) and verified Mr. Garshagen's fabrication of her quotes and facts and she didn't accept interview from Mr. Garschagen after that interview.

You can compare the report and transcript of the interview to find other fabrication, if you want.

--

Regards  
Chaoqun

**Bijlage 19:**

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXX>]

**Verzonden:** dinsdag 19 september 2017 1:02

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXX)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXI](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXI)>

**Onderwerp:** 17. Problems in Sea Flower Island report

Chinese investeerders vrezen barstende zeepbellen

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2016/12/27/in-paradijselijk-hainan-zijn-ze-nerveus-over-de-zeepbellen-5881888-a1538573>

After our visit in Tanmen town, Qionghai city, Hainan province, we went to Danzhou city where Sea Flower Island is located. We hired a local driver to the sales center and had a look of the construction site, we listened to the introduction of this project from a salesperson, and then left there without making any interview. It was on June 10th, 2016(see attached screenshot of my cellphone photo roll).

1. Caravans of concrete trucks and 15,000 yellow-haired construction workers make for dusty activity.

Problem: I couldn't find the source of this 15 000 workers neither from the information(see attached information document) I gathered for Mr. Garschagen, nor in other places. Please ask him to provide the source.

2. Leng Chaoqun, owner of a chain of jewelry stores in the Chongqing and Chengdu metropolitan areas, hesitates whether he is going to buy one or two vacation apartments of 120 square meters.

Stephanie Leng goes about the money , as in many Chinese families, and has chosen a combination of an apartment (from 350,000 euros) and one of the smaller villas (from 950,000 euros) with swimming pool and sauna.

Problem: We didn't meet Mr. Leng Chaoqun and his wife Stephanie Leng. Please ask Mr. Garschagen to provide the spouse's contact information, interview notes, tape recording, pictures, etc..

--

Regards

Chaoqun

## Bijlage 20:

**Van:** Charles Zhang [<mailto:chaoqunchung@XXXXX>]

**Verzonden:** dinsdag 19 september 2017 4:21

**Aan:** Schouten, Elske <[E.Schouten@XXXXX](mailto:E.Schouten@XXXXX)>

**CC:** Jong, Sjoerd de <[s.dejong@XXXXX](mailto:s.dejong@XXXXX)>

**Onderwerp:** 19. Problems in Floating Solar Power Station report

De energierevolutie in China

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2017/09/08/china-kleurt-groen-12902464-a1572802>

The visit in floating solar power station was In Huainan city, Anhui, on July 25th, 2017. I was surprised to find Mr. Garschagen's reporting was not suspended even though I had provided some solid evidence about his serious news fabrication, but I was more surprised that his fabrication didn't stop even after my exposure!

1. Underground, now the bottom of the lake, it was only hot, says the ex-miner. Normally, he transfers workers, cables and solar panels to the work ponies.

"The closure of the depleted mine was inevitable, certainly after the last big explosion - in 2004 - where twelve of Wang's team sizes disappeared. For those reasons he did not bother from home to the mine"

"In addition to his salary and miners' pension - together with 3,000 euros a year - the steering officer earns another 20 euros a month on the sale of excess electricity to the electricity company."

Problem: We didn't talk with this ex-miner with surname Wang and now steering officer of a boat in the floating power station. A boatman took us to the lake, but we didn't talk, the boat was very noisy, we couldn't talk, after a look on the lake, we left the power station. Please ask Mr. Garschagen to provide contact information, interview tape recording and notes of his interview with this Mr. Wang.

Please also ask Mr. Garschagen to explain who the elder is in the picture used in the report(please see attached picture of the person), is he the ex-miner and boatman Mr. Wang, as Mr. Garschagen mentioned in this report? I know the person's name is Wang Xuexiang(see screenshot of chat history between Mr. Garschagen and me) , we visited his family in Luojiatuan village, Feidong county, Anhui province after seeing the floating solar power station in Huainan city, Anhui province. I also took a picture of him(please see attached picture of him took by me). Mr. Wang's home is about two hours drive away from the floating solar power station. The reason we visited Mr. Wang's family was because he is a beneficiary of a national poverty reduction plan by solar panel installation on rooftop.

2. Not only here, but at dozens of other places in China, solar panel parks are set as large as Dutch provinces. Some in the form of huge pandas, a local driver's idea to increase the popularity of space-saving panels.

Problem: There is only one solar power station in the form of panda so far(see the link 1 below). The idea of a panda shape solar power station is not from a local driver, but a 17 years old Chinese student who studies in America. I have verified this with the PR director in Panda Green(<http://www.pandagreen.com/en/home>) which is the owner and operator of

this panda shape solar power station, the fact can also be verified by a news report(see the link 2 below). Please ask Mr. Garschagen to supply the information source of his description.

<http://www.chinanews.com/ny/2017/08-11/8302050.shtml> 首个“熊猫电站”正式运营 25年可提供32亿度电

<http://energy.people.com.cn/n1/2017/0726/c71895-29429985.html> “熊猫电站的创意来源于一个17岁留美中国高中生,是将太阳能发电站按照中国国宝——大熊猫的形象设计建设。”

3. Opinion polls show that 93 percent of Chinese think the climate is changing through human activity and that is why action is being taken. It is believed that this high percentage is related to the increasing concern about the pollution of the air and groundwater. Problem: the poll result in this report is probably a revision of a poll result reported by Foreign Policy(see the link below) in this May. Please ask Mr. Garschagen to provide the source of the poll result in this result.

<http://foreignpolicy.com/2017/05/31/the-convenient-disappearance-of-climate-change-denial-in-china/>

“On the one hand, it suggested that 93 percent of Chinese people think climate change is happening and the majority of respondents believe it “will harm themselves and their own family.” (For comparison, a Yale survey of Americans taken around the same time found that only 70 percent believe in climate change, and a far smaller portion says it will affect them.) Yet the Renmin study found that just 55 percent of Chinese people think humans are the primary cause of global warming, a percentage roughly comparable with the United States.”

4. In the hot nebula, the three steamy towers descend from one of Anhui's largest coal plants, because the demand for electricity is huge.

At most three kilometers from the floating solar panel park, this center is fully operational; The black fuel is derived from mines elsewhere in the province. Although this year, with great fuss, all new plans for coal-fired power stations have been rejected, plans in recent years can only be implemented. A fourth tower is under construction, proving that the story that China has completely shut down the construction of coal-fired power plants is not true. Problem: We saw a coal fired power station on our way to the floating solar power station in Huainan. But Mr. Garschagen fabricated that "a fourth tower is under construction", please see attached two pictures I took when we passed by the power station, there were already four cooling towers in operation, and you can see "淮南(huainan)" in one picture, I also attach a screenshot of my photo roll on that day, then you can see these pictures were taken by me in the same day. Mr. Garschagen had serious doubt about Chinese government's plan to completely stop the construction of coal fired power station(this plan actually also doesn't exist), so he asked me to find evidence online, to ask experts to prove his doubt, but nobody could verify his doubt was true. Then he just took this coal fired power station to prove his doubt about an imagined plan.

"The story that China has completely shut down the construction of coal-fired power plants" is an imagined plan made by Mr. Garschagen, Chinese government doesn't have this kind of national wide plan to completely stop the construction of coal fired power stations, it just announced to stop the construction of coal fired power stations in 13 provinces and municipalities in early 2017(see the link below).

<http://news.bjx.com.cn/html/20170116/803648.shtml> 能源局下发13省市新建火电机组停建清单

5. a. "The coal industry's pie is getting smaller and therefore the coal and old industrial provinces are getting harder for their piece," says Yan Ying of Greenpeace China.
- b. "That's right because the fear of social unrest is huge, as millions in the coal industry are losing their jobs. Employment in the sustainable energy sector is increasing, but with one million jobs it is not as big as in the coal sector. It can all be much faster if political barriers are taken away," said the Chinese environmentalist.
- c. And, in a reluctant way, she adds: "The whole world thinks that because we are now the world's leader in solar generation and solar panels and systems, it's going to be a very fast move to a green China, but that's a totally wrong impression. We still have a long way to go."

Problem: These are 3 quotes of Ms. Yan Jing(not Yan Ying as described in this report) from Green Peace China used in this report. I had shown them to Ms. Yang, and she said, "I don't remember I had said quote b, I have to check my notes for the interview," "quote c doesn't fit my original intention well". Here attached is the tape recording of that interview between Ms. Yan Jing and Mr. Garschagen on July 17th(in English, so I didn't transcribe the interview for Mr. Garschagen), you can either listen to this 24 minutes tape(the format of this file is amr, please play it with a suitable audio player) or verified these quotes with Ms. Yan herself.

Ms. Yan Jing's contact information:XXXXXXXXXXXX [jyan@XXXXXXXXXXXX](mailto:jyan@XXXXXXXXXXXX)

--

Regards  
Chaoqun